

Russia and Islam

Algis Prazauskas
**Vytautas Magnus University,
Kaunas, Lithuania**

Developments in Russia are important for the European Union for both political and economic reasons. Therefore, the analysis of the Islamic factor in Russian politics seems relevant for this course, especially since there are more Muslims in Russia than in the entire Europe, and Russia has had permanent contact with Islam for over 1000 years. Thus, the case study of Islam in Russia, despite certain reservations about Russian specifics, can provide at least partial answers to questions concerning coexistence of Islamic and non-Muslim civilizations and the ability of Islam to find adequate responses to challenges of modernity and globalization. To put it another way, to what extent is Islam compatible with a modern secular state? This is the major, in fact, the central question concerning the role of Islam in the modern world. In the Russian case, however, the obvious reservation is about compatibility of Islam and democracy.

Historical background

Ancestors of modern Russians have had contacts with Muslims since the middle of the seventh century. Islam spread within the territory of modern Russia earlier than Christendom, mostly through the efforts of Muslim missionaries from Central Asia. It was officially proclaimed as the state religion of the Volga Bulgarians (modern Tatars) in 922, in the presence of a huge mission (some 5,000 persons) from the Khalif of Baghdad. The Grand Duke of Kiev Vladimir (ruled 980-1015) is recorded to have held a discussion with the representatives of three monotheistic religions while making his choice in favor of Christendom in 988-989. Although delighted at marital habits of the Muslims, he nevertheless rejected Islam, since he found circumcision and the ban on pork and wine unacceptable. As he stated "drinking is the joy in Rus, we cannot exist without it."¹

The Volga Bulgarians were defeated by the Mongols in 1236, and their stronghold Bulgar for a short time was the capital of the Golden Horde. The Mongolian conquerors of Russia increasingly converted to Islam beginning in the early 14th century, and Islam was declared to be the official religion by khan Uzbek in 1313. For the Christian majority, Mongols became part of a single Tataro-Mongol group. The Russians fought the Tatars in 1376, 1399, 1411, 1431 and this was the main reason why Muslims were increasingly regarded as principal enemies and described in negative terms in early Russian literature. During Tataro-Mongol rule, the Russians were not forced to adopt Islam, and even Russian Orthodox missionaries were allowed to spread their faith among the Golden Horde, while Russian principalities preserved a fairly wide autonomy. Nevertheless, the Muslims were regarded, as the principal enemy of the 'true', i.e. Russian Orthodox faith. Muslim rule, later labeled as Tatar-Mongolian yoke, lasted till the early 16th century. The liberation struggles of the Russians had certain parallels with the Reconquista in Spain - a circumstance noted by some Russian scholars. Fragmentation of the Golden Horde into a number of khanates (Kazan, Astrakhan, Crimean, Siberian, Nogay Horde) facilitated the liberation, especially since the rulers of Muscovy managed to pursue politics of divide and rule, which was exemplified by the Russian-Crimean treaty of 1474, directed against the Great Horde and the Lithuanian-Polish state. Nevertheless, Russian xenophobia of the pre-imperial period was predominantly anti-Muslim.²

The Grand Duchy of Moscovy, which emerged as the new core (Kiev being the first one) of the Russian state, started annexation of neighboring khanates. Ivan the Terrible conquered the khanates of

Astrakhan and Kazan (1552) and dealt harshly with the Muslim population. Kazan was virtually demolished, all mosques were destroyed, and Tartars were banned from the town. In 1555, an archbishopric was founded in Kazan with the purpose of converting Tatars to the Russian Orthodox faith. In 1593 mosques were demolished in villages with a mixed Russian and Tatar population.

In Russia, the Church was part of the state, and its principal task was to support autocracy. Other Christian denominations were reluctantly recognized, provided they proclaimed loyalty to the Czar. Attitude towards Islam remained negative for a long time. Muslims were regularly subject to conversion efforts until the late 18th century, and the religion did not enjoy any legal status till the reign of Empress Catherine II. In 1773, The Holy Governing Synod, or the government department dealing with religious affairs, issued an order recognizing tolerance of all faiths and some autonomy in religious affairs. Russian Orthodoxy retained its privileged status, while Islam, alongside with "foreign" Christian groups (Roman Catholics, Lutherans), Judaism and Buddhism, were defined as "tolerated" groups.³ This was followed by the establishment of Muslim Spiritual Assembly in Orenburg, later transformed into Mahometan Spiritual Board in Ufa, headed by a mufti. His powers, however, were limited to holding exams for persons willing to become imams, supervising the clergy, and dealing with family conflicts.

As Russia annexed Northern Caucasus, modern Azerbaijan, and Central Asia, the number of Muslims in the Empire increased. According to the 1897 census, among the total population of 125.6 million there were over 13 million Muslims, or nearly 11 percent. Islam, like other religions, was supervised by the state, and for that purpose four muftiyats were set up, each in charge of a certain region: Turkestan in Tashkent, North Caucasus in Makhachkala (later the capital of the Daghestan republic), Transcaucasia in Baku, and the European part of Russia and Siberia in Ufa. Each muftiyat was subdivided into several mukhtasibats.

There were about 30,000 mosques in 1917. In the newly annexed regions, especially in protectorates of Khiva (Khorezm) Khanate and Bukhara Emirate in Central Asia, Islam enjoyed autonomy and there was little governmental interference in the affairs of Muslim communities. The Tatars preserved their religious educational institutions - numerous mektebe and madrasah, and their literacy rate was higher than that of ethnic Russians.⁴ On the other hand, while colonial modernization was under way in the Volga region (university of Kazan founded in 1804) and the Baku oilfields, no effort was made to modernize the traditional, essentially medieval, Muslim communities. Muslim periphery remained the most backward regions of the Empire.

The upsurge of militant Russian nationalism and Pan Slavism in the second half of the nineteenth century, following the assertion of nationalism all over Europe, evoked a reaction among those minorities, which were more exposed to modernization. Among Muslims, the major intellectual movement was Panturkism, while Panislamism did not gain many adherents.⁵ Panturkism emerged among the Tatar and Crimean Tatar intellectuals as a cultural liberal movement during 1880s. The motto of the movement, coined by its leader Ismail Gasprinsky (Ismail bey Gaspraly, 1851-1914), was "Dilde, Fikirde, Iste birlik", i.e. Unity in language, faith and actions. To achieve these aims, Gaspraly insisted on the necessity to reform education, to modernize life-style of the Muslims, and create a single language for all Turkic peoples. In order to promote the Turkic unity Gasprinsky coined Turki, or "lisan-I umumi" - "common language," a kind of Turkic Esperanto, based on the Crimean Tartar dialect. He popularized his ideas and the language in a number of books and in the newspaper *Tercuman (The Interpreter)*, which he founded in 1883 (published till 1918). His main idea was that all Turkic ethnic groups constituted a single cultural community. Moreover, he considered the Russian Empire as a Tatar legacy and proclaimed that it should include all Turkic groups, making Russia an important Muslim-Christian state.⁶ His ideas were tolerated by the Czarist regime since they coincided with the aspirations of the government to annex Istanbul and several other Turkish parts of the Ottoman Empire. Gasprinsky also strived to reform Muslim education, promoting usul-I ceded, a "new method of teaching" in schools, first started by Shikjabeddin Marjani.

Jadidism became a blanket term for reform movement among Russian Muslims. By 1916, there were over 5000 "new method" schools, where modern subjects and languages were taught. Modern education also was introduced in many of 700 madrasahs of North Caucasus, notably in Daghestan.⁷

During the revolution of 1905 political mobilization of Muslim elites increased considerably amid pan-Islamic ideas gaining some popularity. The First Muslim congress was convened in Nizhny-Novgorod and called for the unity of all Muslims. At the next two congresses in 1906, the Union of Russian Muslims (Russiya Musulmanlarinin Ittifaki) was set up and transformed into a political party. Some leaders of the Panturkic movement (notably Yusuf Akcura-oglu) went as far as to favor the political union of Turkic nations, with Turkey - not Russia - as its core.

During World War I, a committee of Russian Muslims in Istanbul called for the creation of the independent khanates of Turkestan, Kazan and Crimea. As the Russian Empire broke up following the revolutions of 1917 and uprisings started in Central Asia, Volga-Urals region and the Caucasus, the idea looked feasible for some time. However, within a few years the Bolshevik regime suppressed Panturkic and Panislamic movements, although armed resistance of the Basmachi in Central Asia continued up to 1933.

Militant atheism was an integral part of the Soviet ideology. Since mid-1920s Islam and other religions became increasingly suppressed. Mosques were destroyed, mullahs were forbidden to preach, and thousands of them were exiled or executed. 30,000 mosques were closed or destroyed, and 14,000 Islamic religious schools were closed.⁸ With the obvious purpose of creating a barrier to written sources of Islam, the Arabic alphabet, used by Muslims, was replaced by Roman in 1929 and by Cyrillic/Russian a decade later. Thus the younger generation became unable to read literature written in Arabic script both in their native languages and Arabic. The Russian Orthodox church was also treated harshly, but during the World War II the government softened its attitude. Islam, on the contrary, became even more suspect, and several Muslim ethnic groups, including Crimean Tatars, Chechens, Ingushes and others were deported to Central Asia. By 1948 there were only 416 officially registered mosques in the Russian Federation, and the figure dropped to 311 during next twenty years.⁹ There was only one madrasah, Mir-arab in Bukhara, until an Islamic institute was opened in Tashkent in mid 1970s.

For the purposes of supervision and control, the Soviet regime reorganized the earlier four muftiyats into corresponding Muslim Religious Boards under The Council of The Affairs of Religious Cults. Every Board had a written constitution and an executive committee, formally elected by a body of Alims and general Muslims. Closely supervised by the authorities and the KGB, the Boards were permitted to explain Islam, to propagate Fatwas of Muftis about religious matters, to appoint imams and muazzins of mosques, to give certificate to the Alims and to publish a limited number of religious books. The most influential among these boards was the Central Asian Spiritual Board. Religious literature, including the Koran (except for a limited academic edition in Russian) were virtually non-available.

Antireligious indoctrination in schools, mass-media, cinema and literature alongside with social mobilization (albeit Soviet-style) and female education during several generations caused changes within Muslim communities, especially among more urbanized groups of Tatars, Bashkirians of the Volga-Urals region and Siberia. Polygamy and joint family virtually disappeared and only a few Muslims attended mosques, especially in the cities. As numerous opinion polls show, at the end of the Soviet period the number of believers declined sharply, e.g. in 1980 among rural Tatars only 15.7 % regarded themselves as believers, while 59% were indifferent to religion.¹⁰ The situation was somewhat different in North Caucasus, where tradition remained strong.

Next to antireligious education and propaganda, another means of diluting Muslim identity and solidarity was what was called Leninist nationalities policy of the Soviet state. "Nationalities" were

regarded as integral component parts of the community called the 'Soviet people', while ethnicity was made one of the central elements of the identity structure and recorded in the internal passports and other documents.¹¹ This practice was perceived as acceptable in the European part where most groups had developed a strong sense of their ethnic identity, and nationalism had replaced or absorbed religion. However, in the Muslim areas of Central Asia, and with some uncertainty the North Caucasus, no political units based on ethnicity had existed and there were no nations in the modern sense of the term. However, in Turkestan in 1924, the Bolshevik regime carved out five republics along ethnic lines: Uzbekistan, Turkmenistan, Kyrgyzstan, Kazakhstan and Tajikistan. Similarly, separate autonomous Muslim republics were created in the Volga region (Tatarstan and Bashkiria/Bashkortostan) and the Northern Caucasus. Existence of separate political and administrative units laid ground for the emergence of ethno-regional political and cultural elites and inevitably contributed to the growth of ethnic identity, although in some cases (notably in Central Asia) sub-ethnic cleavages were prevalent.

An important aspect of modernization was the spread of Russian language, culture, and way of life. University education was almost exclusively in Russian, and in the autonomous republics of Russia, high schools with a native language as the medium of instruction were on the verge of disappearing. A few scores of books (counting by titles) were published in the languages of the minorities of the Russian Federation, while the figure was over 1,000 for the Baltic and Ukrainian languages. The net result was that modernity and an urban life style in many regions, especially in Belarus, Kazakhstan, Eastern Ukraine, and internal areas populated by minorities, became closely associated with the Russian language and culture. Actually, the land the Muslims were living in changed dramatically under the pressure of state policy and modernity. Compared to other Muslim regions in Asia and Africa, Islam in Russia definitely lost much ground.

There were several exceptions to this overall trend. The number of mixed marriages between Muslims and non-Muslims remained very low, especially in the case of Muslim females marrying non-Muslim males. Another exception was that Muslims generally did not adopt some conspicuous elements of the Soviet life-style, including the Russian drinking habits and sexual revolution which was well under way since the 1960s. Thus, despite the fact that the numbers of practicing Muslims declined sharply, they generally preserved their cultural identity by combining Muslim and ethnic components. This was especially true of Muslim intellectuals of rural origin, who were closer related to their traditional cultural background.

After the death of Stalin, Muslims who were almost totally isolated from rest of the Muslim world were permitted to maintain some contacts with Muslim world. This was attained with delegations from different Muslim states coming to the Soviet Union, and some Soviet Muslims going to different Muslim states. To improve its relations with the Muslim countries, the Soviet government made some concessions to the Soviet Muslims, whose numbers reached 47 million, or about 17% of the total population by the end of the Soviet rule.

Modern situation: statistics, regional patterns and dynamics

According to the 2002 census, the ethnic Muslim population of the Russian Federation was 14.5 million, or about 10% of the total population. The principal groups are Tatars (about 3 million.) and Bashkirs (1.6 million) in the Volga-Urals region, Dagestanis, Chechens, Ingushs, Karachays, Balkars, Circassians and Kabardins and others in the Northern Caucasus. According to different sources there are 1.5 million Azerbaijanis living in Russia (legally or illegally), as well as one million Kazakhs and several hundred thousand Uzbeks and Tajiks. Muslim spiritual leaders claim the actual number may be as high as 20 or even 23 million, the former figure on more than one occasion mentioned by President Vladimir Putin.¹² However, since religious affiliation was not registered during the population census, there is no

reliable nationwide data about the number of practicing Muslims in Russia. Regardless, the total number of Muslims in Russia is larger than the combined number of Muslims in the rest of Europe, including the Balkan countries.

Although no all-Russian Muslim umma, or community, exists, the Muslims remain divided into two principal blocks. One of them, albeit rather amorphous territorially, is located in Russia proper, mainly the Volga-Urals region, i.e. Tatarstan, Bashkortostan, Udmurtia, Chuvashia, Mariy El, and pockets in Ulyanovsk, Samara, Astrakhan, Perm, Nizhny Novgorod, Yekaterinburg oblasti, Siberia. According to unofficial statistics, there are up to 1,500,000 Muslims (and six mosques) in Moscow, giving the Russian capital a largest concentration of Muslims in Europe, and about 250,000 in St.Petersburg and the region.¹³ The other Muslim area is the Northern Caucasus where the total number of compactly settled (but ethnically fragmented) Muslims is about 4.5 million. Each of these two regions is divided by internal ethnic differences, is self-sufficient from the viewpoint of their cultural and religious tradition, and preoccupied with their own problems, including relations with the central government.

Large majority of Russian Muslims are Sunnis. Azeri immigrants, part of Lezgins and Dargins of Daghestan are Shias. Of the four legal schools (mazhabs), two are spread in Russia - Khanafi and Shafi. Khanafi is the most liberal of the four, and it is prevalent in Russia (Tatars, Bashkirs, majority of North Caucasian groups and Central Asian diasporas). The more conservative Shafi mazhab prevails among Daghestanis (except Nogayans), Chechens and Ingushes. Among Chechens and Ingushes there are followers of non-temple Islam, belonging to Nakshbandiya and Kadiriya sects.

Islamic revival

As indicated above, during the Soviet period the influence of Islam (or religion generally) and the number of practicing Muslims declined very sharply. Very few people, especially in the Volga-Urals republics and the cities of Russia proper, attended mosques. The Koran was virtually unavailable, since there was only a limited academic edition in Russian, and an unknown number of copies smuggled from abroad. In 1990 the total number of the Muslim clergy in Russia was limited to 55 mullahs and 12 muezzins, among them only one had higher spiritual education. Thus, in this respect, Islam lagged far behind Catholicism, despite the fact that the number of Muslims was about 10 times greater.¹⁴

The collapse of communism left a spiritual and ideological vacuum for many individuals and a whole social strata. Despite the opportunities of social and political mobilization after 1990, the possibilities of upward social mobility were mostly monopolized by local bureaucratic and former Communist elites, making many ambitious individuals, members of the lower social strata and intellectuals disillusioned and socially alienated. For a brief period of the late 1980s and early 1990s, nationalism seemed to pose an attractive alternative, labeled as national renaissance, or revival. However, after the break-up of the Soviet Union, large sections of the population became disillusioned with nationalism, while the continuing economic crisis in post-Soviet republics, including Russia, inevitably drew people towards the church or religious groups. Religious revival took place in all post-Soviet republics, including Russia. A great number of Russians turned to their Orthodox faith, albeit in many cases this trend was a matter of fashion, especially for political elites, as former communists started attending religious festivities.

After the fall of Communism, thousands of mosques opened in Russia, the system of religious education emerged and contacts with Muslim countries were re-established. The importance of religion in the life of ethnic Muslims in Russia has grown considerably over the last decades. This phenomenon has been called the Muslim Renaissance or Revival. Curiously enough, the term Renaissance has not been applied to the Russian Orthodox church, despite obvious parallels and the fact that this church enjoys the support of the state.

The numbers of Muslims in Russia grew thanks to a higher natural growth rate and to intensive immigration from Central Asian countries, especially ethnic Kazakhs, Tajiks and Uzbeks. The growing demand for unskilled labor in the Russian Federation, and the virtually open borders in these regions, make migration easy.

The Muslim religious education network consists of over a hundred Islamic colleges and madrassas. The number of mosques was over 7,000 in 2000 (more than in Egypt with its 75 million population), there were 3098 registered Muslim communities and 114 Muslim educational institutions.¹⁵ Russian Muslims maintain regular contacts with other Muslims abroad. The importance of religion in the life of ethnic Muslims in Russia has grown considerably over the last decades. At the same time, the Islamic "renaissance," which started in the late 1980s, has failed to unite Russia's Muslims into a single umma, or community of believers. Each of the two main blocks (the Volga region and North Caucasus) is self-sufficient from the viewpoint of their cultural and religious tradition, and preoccupied with their own problems, including relations with the central and local governments. The government has given into this pressure to some extent and has, for example, provided funding for the foundation of an Islamic University within Moscow State University. Over 800 students studied at Muslim institutions in Egypt, Saudi Arabia, Syria, Qatar and Turkey.

Probably, the most important aspect of the Muslim renaissance in Russia is the fact that Muslims began to identify themselves as part of the global Muslim community and are striving to overcome the minority, or "younger brother" syndrome, formed during the Soviet period.¹⁶ Obviously, for this reason Alexey Malashenko and several other Russian experts on Islam interpreted the initial consequences of the Muslim revival in positive terms. However, several years later there was a growing concern about "the balance of influence within the Muslim community inside Russia shifting towards radical elements of Islamic activism."¹⁷

Organizations

After the break-up of the Soviet Union, no single authoritative Muslim centre emerged in Russia. The major reasons are the low level education of Muslim spiritual leaders, the fact that Muslim population is scattered over a very wide area and divided by ethnic allegiances, as well as the wish to control the flow of money from the Gulf states for the construction of mosques, education, and other religious purposes. The conflict in many cases turned into open animosity among the top leaders.

The process of fragmentation started at the First Congress of the Muslims of North Caucasus in May 1989. The regional spiritual board broke up, as Checheno-Ingushetia, then a single republic, and Kabardino-Balkaria set up their own boards, followed shortly by other republics and ethnic communities. By mid-1990s every ethnic group of North Caucasus had its own spiritual board.

Talgat Tajutdin, who was elected as the chairman of the Spiritual Board of the European part of Russia and Siberia in 1980, strived to become a top leader of all Muslims of Russia. Although supported by the government of the Russian Federation (at least until he declared jihad against the United States at the start of the war in Iraq), he lost his popularity under the pressure of younger leaders and due to discontent of the Muslims over the fact that in a new grand mosque of Naberezhnye Chelny in Tatarstan stained glass images of the cross and the David's star were constructed. As a result, separate spiritual boards were set up in Tatarstan and Bahkortostan in 1992. Even in Moscow several centers came into being, such as the Spiritual Board of the Muslims of the Central European Region of Russia and Coordinating Council of the regional spiritual boards of the Muslims of the European part of the former Soviet Union and Siberia in 1994. By early 1997, 47 Muslim spiritual boards were registered. At present,

each republic (except Mariy-El) has its own spiritual board, while Bahkortostan has three, including the Central Spiritual Board of the Muslims of Russia and European states of CIS, headed by Talgat Tajutdin.

Since the mid 1990s at least five centers have been competing to become central institutions, representative of all Muslims of Russia. These centers are:

- the Central Spiritual Board of the Muslims of Russia and the European States of CIS, head - mufti T.Tajutdin;
- the Supreme Coordinating Centre of the Muslims of Russia, its chairman A.A.Niyazov calls himself supreme mufti of Russia;
- the Islamic Cultural Centre in Moscow, director A.A.Niyazov;
- the Council of Muftis, headed by mufti R.Gainutdin; muftis of many regions are members of the council; and the
- the Union of the Muslims of Russia, initially was headed by Nadirshah Khachilaev.

The process of fragmentation appears to have come to an end and integrationist trends are fairly obvious. In April 1996, heads of a number of spiritual boards created the Council of Russian Muftis. The influence of the Council has been growing since its creation. Its chairman, Ravil Gainutdinov, is recognized by Muslim elites countrywide, and he is accepted by the Kremlin as leading religious figure. The principal aims of the Council are:

1. to consolidate the Muslim religious organizations of the Russian Federation with the goal of compatibly identifying the most important problems concerning all Russian Muslims together;
2. to coordinate and assist in the operation of each other's organization;
3. to define positions in relations with the organs of the central and local government, the organizations representing different religions, and international foreign organizations;
4. to create necessary conditions for the observance of the rights and the protection of the interests of Russian Muslims.¹⁸

The Eurasia movement headed by A. Dugin and T. Tajutdin and the Eurasian party of A. Niyazov and N. Ashirov have a certain influence among the Muslims of Central Russia and Siberia and the support of some politicians.

Despite these integrationist trends, no consolidated Muslim movement or political Islam as a unitary actor has emerged in Russia. There is a number of groups, including some that have political objectives, but generally the movement remains fragmented.

Political trends and regional differences.

Central Russia and Siberia

Muslim communities in Tatarstan, the Volga basin, the southern Urals, Siberia and Moscow have a similar history and generally follow the liberal variety of mazhab known as Khanafism. Of late, relations among various Islamic institutions are characterized by efforts toward integration, but also by tensions between certain leaders - especially between Talgat Tajuddin, the former head of Russian Muslims under the Soviet rule, and Ravil Gainutdin, Chairman of the Council of the Muftis of Russia and Imam of the Moscow Cathedral Mosque.

There were symptoms of political Islam in early 1990s as Party of Islamic Revival, Nur social movement, Union of the Muslims of Russia, Refakh social movement were founded. However, they failed to gain popular support, and much less to merge into a united movement. Although some leaders

made a personal political career, not a single of them managed to articulate social, cultural, and religious interests of Russian Muslims. With regional and ethnic differences considered, the existence of such common interests is anything but obvious.

The mosques in inner regions and republics have not become centers of political opposition, although in some cases small circles of radical youth have formed. Outside North Caucasus the Russian Muslims have not taken up new religious trends, like Wahhabism, incompatible with Khanafism. This was due to the efforts both of Sunni clergy and the Russian secret services.¹⁹

In Tatarstan the Muslim elites were preoccupied with reform, and the term Neo-Jadidism has appeared alongside with Euroislam (the latter term being introduced by Rafael Khakimov, political counselor of the President of the Republic). Thus, teleological discussion is gaining momentum. More importantly, at their meetings the Muslims prefer to discuss religious and mundane affairs of the community, but not politics. Compared to the wide public debate on Muslim issue in France, UK, or United States, the problem of Islam in Central Russia and Siberia is discussed by a small group of experts and journalists.

Russian experts have widely different opinions about the role of Islam in inner Russia. According to Alexei Malashenko, generally, Russian Muslims, except those in the Caucasus, have not been influenced by radical brand of Islam generally labeled as "Wahhabism" by the authorities.²⁰ Radical trends have not spread among in the Volga-Urals region and have not morphed into a regular ideological or political movement. Among the reasons of this resistance is Wahhabism's incompatibility with traditional Khanafism. Another factor may be the general religious apathy inherited from the Soviet era. An important (though probably not decisive) disincentive was also the opposition of the local Sunni clergy and vigilance of the special services. Previously in the shadow of these two more visible forces, Islamic militancy from groups inside Russia proper is on the rise.²¹

Rather than inclining toward radical Islamism, some Tatar intellectuals - of both secular and religious backgrounds - have displayed an interest in Islamic reform and some, such as Rafael Khakimov, a political adviser to the President of Tatarstan, are playing with the idea of "Euro-Islam." This turn towards "Euro-Islam" has stimulated theological and ideological debates on such issues as the relation between idjtihad (the right to have an independent opinion) and taklid (the duty to follow authoritative Islamic edicts). The beginnings of theological debate are welcome by the authorities and some experts, but essentially they reflect ambitions of Tatar intellectuals, who have traditionally regarded themselves as representatives of the most advanced among Muslim nations.

Thus, the attitudes among the Muslims of Central Russia, the Volga region and Siberia appear to be essentially pragmatic, and Muslim leaders and authoritative Russian experts with few exceptions, brush aside the possibility of potentially dangerous trends in Islam within interior of Russia. However, in several cases even the moderate Muslim leaders raise claims that are incompatible with the secular character of the modern state. For example, in 1997 the top Muslim clergymen including Gabdulla Khazrat Galiulla, the chairman of the Spiritual Board of Muslims of Tatarstan, and Sheikh Ravil Gainutdin, the chairman of the Council of Russian Muftis met on October 28 with Russian Minister for Nationalities Vyacheslav Mikhailov and Russian Deputy Prime Minister Ramazan Abdulatipov, to discuss the possibility of forming special Muslim regiments in the Russian army.²² At the start of the Iraq war, in March 2003, mufti Talgat Tatjuddin, known for his extravagance, embarrassed the Kremlin by declaring jihad against the United States.

There seem to be sufficient evidence that the situation is not idyllic. At present radical Jamaats exist in practically all larger cities of the Russian Federation. This network is most advanced in regions of the Northern Caucasus, and also in a number of areas in the Volga region, not only Tatarstan and

Bashkiria, long time Moslem areas, but in the predominantly Russian provinces such as the Uljanovsk, Penza, Volgograd and Astrakhan regions as well as Central Russia. Generally, these groups have limited membership, e.g. jamaat in Ulyanovsk had about 80 members, mostly Russians, Chuvashes and Mordvins, converted to Islam. Within a short period of time, this group, like many others, became a criminal gang.²³ According to different estimates, at present (Fall 2004) the system of Jamaats is capable of mobilizing more than 10,000 extremist combatants, and of this number no less than 4000 come from the regions around the Volga and from Central Russia.²⁴

Early in 2002, during one of the polls conducted among Muslims in Moscow on the subject of, "Who best corresponds to the image of a true Muslim?" the respondents gave the third place to Osama bin-Laden.²⁵ Central Asian regimes and especially Uzbekistan's President Islam Karimov have also become more vigorous in the persecution of militant Islamists and this has influenced migration to Russia. Active Islamic extremists fleeing persecution are in turn aggravating the more moderate ethnic Muslim populations in the regions where they are settling, particularly in European Russia and the Urals.

One of the reasons of Muslim radicalism is the absence of any kind of dialogue between fundamentalists and the official Muslim establishment of Russia. The official Muslim leaders have limited contacts with the ordinary believers.²⁶ They are engaged in their fight for power and funds, proclaim themselves loyal followers of "Russian Muslim patriotism" and "traditional Eurasian Islam", thus showing their political servility to the regime.²⁷ In Tatarstan and other regions the members of extremist organization "Khizb ut-Tahrir al-Islami", or Party of the Islamic Liberation (active in Ferghana Valley in Central Asia and banned in Russia), popularly called Khizbs, manage to seize the mosques. Some of them have been arrested, but the sentences were light.²⁸ Since early 90s, hundreds of young Tartars studied at Muslim institutions in Arab countries and have adopted fundamentalist ideology, including Wahhabism. Many of them joined the ranks of the Chechen armed resistance. However, the Tatarstan officials and religious authorities claim that no danger of extremism exists.²⁹

Another reason for the growth of Islamic radicalism is Russia's participation on the side of the United States in the war against global terrorism. Anti-Americanism for several generations has been one of the main features of Soviet propaganda and indoctrination, so Russian Muslims psychologically are prepared to adopt this attitude.

On several occasions radical groups have engaged in bombing attacks on communications and supply lines. The first attack on natural gas infrastructure was near Vyatskie Polyani (Kirov region) in December 1, 1999. It was accomplished by Tatar-Russian graduates. The Federal Security service has been making efforts to thwart the spread of radical Islam in the interior of Russia. A massive onslaught took place in 1999-2000 after the group of Wahhabites from Chechnya invaded Dagestan, and students, as well as some graduates of madrasah in Tatarstan, were suspected of contacts with the guerilla.

In the fall, Ouzbek members of Khizb-ut Tahrir (the Party of Islamic Liberation) were detained in Khanti-Mansi autonomous district in Siberia, other members have been detained not only in Tatarstan and Bashkortostan, but also in the Moscow, Udmurtia, Nizhegorodskaya, Samarskaya, Volgogradskaya, Astrakhanskaya and Tyumen regions.³⁰ In most cases the detainees had religious leaflets, while at the homes of the suspected hand grenades, explosives and ammunition have been found. The Supreme Court of Russia on Feb. 14, 2003 banned 15 radical Muslim organizations. Most of these organizations were active in Chechnya and the neighboring republics of the North Caucasus. Among those active in the inner regions of Russia were Khizb-ut Tahrir, Jammat-i-Islami (Islamic group) in Bashkortostan, Jamiat al-Islah al Ijtimayi (Society for the Social Reform) in Moscow. Majority of their members went underground.³¹

Muslim republics of the Volga region since the fall of communism have been strongholds of local autocratic rulers - Shaimiyev in Tatarstan, Rakhimov in Bashkortostan - and public opinion was definitely

against the changes in Georgia and the Ukraine. At the 1000-years anniversary of Tatar capital Kazan in August 2005 Yushchenko and Saakashvili were greeted with angry shouts of "Go home!"³² However, there is remarkably little organized protest against the semi-feudal rule of local elites, loyal to the Kremlin. Possibilities for political mobilization on ethnic or regional basis actually are non-existent, since the federal Law on the Political Parties, adopted in 2001, recognizes only parties that have their regional organizations in more than half of the 89 territorial units of the Federation.³³ Thus, the enchantment with "moderate" or "reformist" Islam of the inner regions of Russia happily ignores the fact that there are no legal outlets for political dissatisfaction and for the articulation of demands of specific Muslim communities.

Militant Islam in the Northern Caucasus

The issue of Islam in the Caucasus is examined in detail in numerous articles, so here several general remarks concerning the difference between North Caucasian and inner-Russian Islam would be sufficient.

In contrast to the moderate trends of Islam in Central Russia and Siberia, fundamentalist and radical movements have emerged in North Caucasus. Although the rebirth of Islam in that region followed the same lines as in the rest of the Russian Federation, Islam could not avoid politicization under constant pressure caused by two factors. The first is the war in Chechnya, and the second is the impact of modernization on and cultural assimilation of Muslim communities in this region, which was much weaker than in urbanized regions of Central Russia and Siberia. The divisions in the region are also compounded by an inherent antagonism between the local Sufi variety of Islam (Tarikatism) and radical Wahhabism imported from the Middle East.

The activity of armed militants in the Northern Caucasus is based on a wide network of Jamaats, or radical communities. Though the term itself is neutral and means only a Muslim community, it started to be used to label radical Islamic groups as opposed to moderate ones, generally controlled by official Moslem Spiritual Boards. The network of Jamaats, or radical religious communities, recruits new supporters, and provides support and shelter for the Muslim militants. The most important activity of the Jamaats, however, is the constant gathering of information from, and applying pressure upon, local Muslim communities and structures.³⁴

The most Islamized republic in the Northern Caucasus is Daghestan, where the role of Islam in politics has been relatively strong. It is in Daghestan that fundamentalist, Islamist ideas - the so-called Islamic alternative - have found their most vocal expression. Daghestan has been the home of several prominent ideologues of Islamic fundamentalism, such as the late Akhmedkadi Akhtaev - in the early 1990s the emir of the Islamic Rebirth Party, and Sheikh Bagautdin, an ally of Shamil Basaev, the most powerful Chechen commander and advocate of an Islamist state in the Northern Caucasus. It is estimated that over the years the number of Wahhabites in Daghestan ranged from 4,000 to 10,000. However, there may be many more, if one includes passive followers. (In the late 1990s a high-ranking official put the figure at 100,000).³⁵

Due to the geographical proximity of the Middle East, Wahhabism has made a foothold in the region, especially in Daghestan. In 1997 several Wahhabi jamaats were established in Daghestan, the largest one comprising several villages. Proclaiming themselves an "Islamic territory", the Wahhabites refused to obey local authorities and attempted to introduce the Shariah law. Small jamaats, each comprising several hundred members, also were formed in other republics of the region. The radicals were able, during the 1990s, to overcome ethnic cleavages and promoted the idea of forming an single Islamic state from the Caspian to the coast of the Black Sea. In 1999 local Wahhabites supported the forces of Shamil Basaev that invaded Daghestan. In retaliation the authorities stormed rebellious villages

killing Wahhabite leaders and destroying their homes. Later, the followers of Wahhabism were resettled to different parts of Daghestan.

Radical Islam has become a vocal and prominent, but not a dominant Islamic trend in North Caucasus. Even in Chechnya, the idea of a theocratic Muslim state, based on Shariya law, did not gain wide support, despite all the efforts of Arab instructors. Muslim religious councils in the Northern Caucasus strive to prevent the spread of Wahhabism by various means. The influence of Sufi sheikhs has grown immensely, especially as they were supported by local authorities. As a result, in 1999 a law forbidding Wahhabite activities in Daghestan was adopted. The majority of Wahhabite jamaats in North Caucasus were eliminated in 1999 and 2000 following the joint efforts of the local administration, Tarikatists and the central agencies. Furthermore, after September 11, 2001, the government of the Russian Federation restricted or outlawed the activities of most international Islamic organizations supporting religious extremism. Thus, at the turn of the century, Wahhabism generally lost much support in the region, although it retained its basic organizational structure.

By far, not all members of Islamic jamaats are followers of Islamic radicalism, let alone terrorists. Most of the young people in these communities strive to observe and restore Islamic traditions and moral standards. Even in Chechnya, President Jokhar Dudaev was in favor of a secular state and adopted the idea of juihad as the ideology of resistance against the central government.

It is a general rule that the loss of popular support tends to strengthen the extremism of radical movements, especially as social and economic conditions in the region are very adverse and the corruption is prevalent at all levels. During the last several years it has become apparent that Islamist radicals not only survived but also remain an influential political and religious force. The events in Afghanistan and Iran also evoke negative reactions among the Muslims of the region. It was by no means a coincidence that the period of 2002-2003 saw the rise of terrorist activities, including the feminization of terrorism, in South Russia and Moscow. Despite setbacks, the organizational structures of radical Islam has not been destroyed. The persistent Chechen guerrilla also adds publicity and an aura of invincibility to the extremist movement. In 2002-2004 a militant jamaat was formed in Ingushetia. In June 2004 its members took part in the armed assault on Nazran, the capital of Ingushetia, that claimed over 100 casualties.

Like in Israel, the "feminization" of jihad is evident. Women took part of several terrorist acts in the south of Russia as well as in Moscow. Instructors from international Islamic organizations are known to have taken part in the training of women suicide bombers, members of the "Black Widows" battalion formed by Shamil Basaev.

According to different estimates, the system of Jamaats is capable of mobilizing more than 10,000 extremist combatants, of this no less than 4000 from the regions around the Volga region and from Central Russia.

Ethnic Russian Moslems

For the ethnic Russian majority, an especially dangerous trend appears to be Islamitization of ethnic Russians and radicalization of these newly converted Moslems. So far, the conversion scale is limited, with estimates ranging from 10,000 to 30,000 converts nationwide, while Moscow's central Mosque officials recently claimed that 12,000 ethnic Russians had adopted Islam in the period from January-September 2004 alone, 75% of the individuals being girls between the ages of 17-21.³⁶ The first public ethnic Russian Muslims organization of "The Straight Way" (Pryamoy Put) led by ex-Orthodox priest Ali Polosin was formed in 2000. In 2004 the National Organization of Russian Moslems (NORM)

was founded, claiming 2500 members. The group criticized Polosin's group for being too moderate and for avoiding participation in politics.

This number is small compared to the 14.5 million ethnic Muslims as shown by the 2002 census; but it is not negligible as converts are most often active and ambitious people seeking a vehicle of social promotion. However dubious these figures might be, it is the first instance of ethnic Russian Muslim organizations claiming mass conversions.

In contrast to the Turkic people of the Volga-Ural area and the Moslems of the Northern Caucuses, ethnic Russian converts to Islam do not have their own local Islamic tradition and these neophytes are more easily indoctrinated by preachers of the radical Islam, than members of traditional Muslim communities. Not incidentally, ethnic Russian Moslems were first to become suicide bombers in Chechnya in the summer of 2000, and several Russian girls from Moscow were recruited for suicide bombing by Basaev's emissary at Moscow's central Mosque's in 2003.

The important trend is the growth of Islamophobia in Russia, caused both by domestic and global developments. Attacks on Muslims from Central Asia and Caucasus have become a regular feature. Many Russians believe that all terrorist acts in the world are performed by Muslims purely on religious grounds.³⁷ Among the major causes of growing Islamophobia are fears about the demographic trends. According to various forecasts, the population of Russia will drop from the present figure of 143 million to some 100 or even 80 million, mostly due to the negative growth rate among ethnic Russians. Russian non-Muslims increasingly fear Islam, while Russian Muslims increasingly distrust the authorities.³⁸

Foreign Relations

In the 1990s, the process of Islamic revival after Communist-imposed atheism was marked by serious foreign involvement. Gulf States, especially Saudi Arabia, United Arab Emirates, Kuwait and Qatar, as well as non-governmental organizations and influential individuals of these states sponsored the development of religious infrastructure and education in Russia. This caused serious conflict at top levels of the Muslim community, as well as in numerous local mosques where Arab-educated bearers of pure Islamic teaching claimed authority over the moderate mullahs that were traditionally loyal to the government.

Together with migrants from the countries of Central Asia, radical structures characteristic of these regions have also penetrated into the Russian Federation. The most prominent among them is the London-based Hizb ut-Tahrir al-Islamiya (the Islamic Liberation Party), working mainly throughout Uzbekistan. A number of them have been arrested at the request of Uzbekistan's security service with subsequent extradition to Uzbekistan. Since 2003 the group appears to be promoting radical Islam in Russia, and a number of arrests has been made by the authorities. Well-known for their effective secret network, which includes extensive drug trafficking, Hizb ut-Tahrir frequently organizes its jaamats on an ethnic principle and thus has serious potential to strengthen its influence within the growing migrant community. Arrests of persons suspected to be members of radical Muslim organizations has become a regular feature. However, curious episodes happen. In October and November 2004 over 100 members of Hizb-ut Tahrir were arrested in Nizhegorodskaya region. Shortly afterwards the local special services addressed the Muslim Spiritual Board asking to explain what is the Hizb ut-Tahrir.³⁹

One of the ways to counter the spread of radical Islam is development of interstate relations with Muslim countries and organizations. Russia has inherited a part of the Soviet legacy of support for Arab and Palestinian causes in the Middle East conflict, but this fact is irrelevant for the younger generation. During his visit to Malaysia in August 2003 President Putin declared the intention of the Russian federation to join the Organization of Islamic Conference as an observer. He stressed that "20 million

Russian Muslims have the right to feel as a part of the Islamic world."⁴⁰ In April of the same year, Putin affirmed that Russia, to certain degree, can be regarded as part of the Muslim world, since it has about 20 million Muslims, who were not immigrants, but citizens of the state. Russia formally obtained the observer status at OIC on July 1, 2005 at the Sana (Yemen) meeting of the Organization.

The most recent course of action in line with the opening of dialogue with the Arab world has been the liberalization of channels for external financing of Islamic structures and education in Russia. Such sponsorship was all but stopped after 1999 because of the suspicion that such funding was being channeled to militant Islamic groups for the radicalization of local communities. Since 2003, however, this process has been reopened for sponsoring official Moslem Spiritual Boards and their projects, such as the enlargement of the principal Mosque in Moscow and support for the Russian Islamic University of Kazan. The efficacy of developing state-sponsored Islamic infrastructures for the purpose of curbing radicalism, however, has proven to be a dubious policy in other countries, such as Egypt and Algeria, where it has only fueled extremism. Russian analysts believe that this policy will only exacerbate the problem of radicalism. It is unclear whether state agencies will be able to control the use of extremist Arab literature in preaching and curricula in Islamic schools.⁴¹

The position of Russia reflects the efforts to assert its status as a superpower. The special Ambassador for contacts with the OIC admitted that Moscow is ready to act as a link between the West and the Islamic world since "being a great Eurasian power, having a rich experience of interaction among various ethnic and confessional groups, particularly between Orthodoxy and Islam, it can play an important historical role."⁴²

Overextended and insufficiently controlled borders, coupled with a vast territory with numerous military installations, industries and long communications lines, which as ineffectively policed, make Russia is an easy target for terrorist attacks. President Vladimir Putin expanded the scope of this threat in his Address to the Nation on September 4, 2004 by declaring that Russia was a strategic objective of international terrorist aggression.

Conclusions

1. According to many Russian analysts, since the collapse of the Soviet Union, militant Islam remains the most immediate and serious political-military challenge to the Russian state. Some analysts go as far as to claim that, viewed as a power struggle, there are now only two major players in Russian politics - President V. Putin's government and the militant Islam. While the domestic political party opposition to Putin, ranging from right-wing liberals to the Communists, is still present in party form, it was almost totally eliminated from positions of real power in the 1999 and 2003 elections. Furthermore, the Presidential staff exercises more and more control over regional power brokers and major business tycoons. The growing adherents of various forms of radical Islam, increasingly capable of and prepared to use force in order to meet their anti-government objectives, are de-facto the only rival political force within the Russian Federation⁴³. This is quite true for certain regions, notably for North Caucasus, but by no means nationwide, despite terrorist acts in Moscow and a number of regions. Specific Muslim groups challenge the federal and local authorities, but the Muslim population as a whole is not politically mobilized and less capable of social action than, for instance, Muslims in France.

2. The principal reasons for the apparent absence of Muslim unity are ethnic fragmentation and ethno-regional differences, as well as the present stage of secularization of Muslim society in the inner regions of Russia, particularly its urban sections.

3. Restriction of political liberties, particularly strict supervision of mass media and the prohibition of regional parties, sets further limits on articulation of political demands and the emergence of what is

called political Islam. The existing Islamic political trends have not disappeared, but have rather gone underground.

4. The government tolerates what has been called Islamic revival and of late is making efforts to promote the interests of loyal Muslim elites by means of funding Islamic educational programs and establishing official forums. However, this strategy is superfluous because large sections of Muslim elites, since the military intervention in Chechnya, recognized the danger of challenging the government and actually compete among themselves for official recognition and favors.

5. The government does not seem to have a clear strategy of dealing with the Muslim issue, which is certainly not clear for experts and politicians. Its policy is generally reactive, combining repressive measures towards extremist groups, and rewards for the cooperative elites.

6. With the Russian Orthodox Church becoming a semi-official state religion, the Muslim minority inevitably becomes alienated, and turns into a fertile ground for the growth of radical Islam, which may easily turn violent, unless the political system is liberalized and ethno-regional parties, as an integral part of multiethnic polity, are recognized.

7. The low-intensity warfare in Chechnya remains a major cause for terrorism and potentially may destabilize the situation in the whole of Caucasus and beyond. Withdrawal from Caucasus increasingly looks like the best option, although it involves serious political risks.

8. The Chechen war, the terrorist bombings in Russia and the equating of terrorism and Islam have contributed to the growth of Islamophobia in Russia. By all accounts, Muslim minorities are generally viewed in a negative light by the Russian public opinion.

9. Since the political situation in Russia is in a permanent transition and the democratic period is too short for the consolidation of liberal, ethno-nationalist, religious forces, it is too early to draw any conclusions about the capacity of Islam in Russia to meet the challenges of secularism, modernity, and globalization.

Notes

¹ Chronieler quoted in: Batunskij M.A. *Rossija i islam*. [Russia and Islam]. Pt.I. Moscow: Progress-Traditsija, 2003, p. 61).

² Batunskij, op.cit. I, p. 182.

³ Krasikov A. "Annals of Spiritual Freedom: Church-State Relations in Russia," *East European Constitutional Review*, vol. 7, # 2, Spring 1998.

⁴ Amirkhanov R.U. *Islam v Srednem Povolzh'ye: istorija i sovremennost*. Kazan: Master Line, 2001.

⁵ For a detailed account see Chervonnaya S.M. *Panturkizm i panislamizm v rossijskoj istorii* [Panturkism and pan-Islamism in Russian history]. < <http://www.fundarabist.ru/Opinionarabist/Rus@Muslim/Muslim@Russia.htm>>

⁶ Ismail-bey Gasprinskij. *Russkoe musul'manstvo. Mysli, zametki i nablyudenija musul'manina*. [Russian Muslims. Thoughts, notes and observations of a Muslim]. Simferopol, 1881.

⁷ Goryaeva L.V. *Musul'manskoje prosveshchenije v Rossii*. [Muslim education in Russia].

<<http://www.fundarabist.ru/Opinionarabist/Rus@Muslim/Muslim@Russia.htm>>

⁸ Donna E. Arzt, "Historical Heritage or Ethno-National Threat? Proselytizing and the Muslim Umma of Russia,," *12 Emory International Law Review*, 1998, p. 436.

⁹ However, the figures differ widely. E.g. according to other assessment, in 1956 there were only 94 mosques in Russia. - Gainutdin, Mufti R., *Islam v sovremennoj Rossii* [Islam in Modern Russia]. Moskva: Grand, 2004, p. 39.

¹⁰ Gainutdin, op.cit., p. 73.

¹¹ Identity structure reflects membership in a number of groups of various nature, including gender, age, profession, ethnicity, family status, etc.

- ¹² Malashenko A. *The Islamic Factor in Russia*. <<http://www.neweuropereview.com/English/english-malashenko.cfm>> 15.11.2004 / Source: *New Europe Review*/
- ¹³ *Nezavisimaya gazeta*, August 2, 2005.
- ¹⁴ Catholic community consisted mostly of Lithuanians, Polish minority and a part of Latvians.
- ¹⁵ Mukhametshin F.M. *Musul'mane Rossii: sud'by, perspektivy, nadezhdy* [Muslims of Russia: Fate, Prospects, and Hopes]. Moskva, 2001, p. 72.
- ¹⁶ For detailed account see Malashenko A. *The Islamic Renaissance in Contemporary Russia*. Moscow,
- ¹⁷ Georgi N.Engelhardt . *Militant Islam in Russia - Potential for Conflict* <http://mdb.cast.ru/mdb/1-2005/wap/militant_islam/>; Date: Mon, 04 Apr 2005>
- ¹⁸ Preston, R. Christopher, "Islam in Russia under the federal law on freedom of conscience and on religious associations: official tolerance in an intolerant society," *Brigham Young University Law Review*, 0360151X, 2001, Vol. 2001, Issue 2
- ¹⁹ Engelhardt G., op cit..
- ²⁰ Malashenko A. *Islamic factor in Russia*. The Carnegie Moscow Center. Articles and interviews
- ²¹ Engelhardt G , op.cit. <http://mdb.cast.ru/mdb/1-2005/wap/militant_islam/>
- ²² RFE/RL NEWSLINE Vol 1, No. 150, Part I, 31 October 1997
- ²³ *Nezavisimaya gazeta*, May 27, 2005.
- ²⁴ Engelhardt G, op.cit.
- ²⁵ *Vsyo ob Islame* [All about Islam]. March 2002, No.1, p. 9
- ²⁶ E.g. in Kazan only official recognized imam-khatybs are permitted to hold Friday prayers in mosques and any discussion between the imams and the audience is forbidden. - *Nezavisimaya gazeta*, May 18, 2005.
- ²⁷ Magomedov A. , professor of political science of the Ulyanovsk Technical University in *Nezavisimaya gazeta* May 27, 2005. - <www.ng.ru>
- ²⁸ The party is believed to have been founded in Jerusalem in 1952 on the basis of a local cell of the Muslim Brotherhood. The aim of the party is to restore a single Islamic Khalifate. Amir of the organisation Abdel Kadel Zalmum resides in Jordan. The party has its cells in Jordan, Tunisia, Palestine, Kuwait, US, France, Norway, Sweden, China, Japan. - *Nezavisimaya gazeta* Jan. 25, 2005.
- ²⁹ *Nezavisimaya gazeta*, May 18, 2005.
- ³⁰ *Nezavisimaya gazeta*, Jan 13, 2005.
- ³¹ *Nezavisimaya gazeta* , Jan. 25, 2005.
- ³² *Nezavisimaya gazeta*, August 25, 2005.
- ³³ Federal'nyj zakon o politicheskikh partijakh [Federal Law on Political Parties] <http://www.putin2004.ru/service/law_info/4006C90B/?session=b016551273fbc5d5187af13ab9025cab>
- ³⁴ Engelhardt G. Op.cit
- ³⁵ Malashenko A., *Islamic Factor...*
- ³⁶ *Nezavisimaya Gazeta*. -Religii, 16.07.2003
- ³⁷ Djabrailov Khusain, "Rossijskoje islamskoje nasledije," *Nezavisimaya gazeta*, March 25, 2005
- ³⁸ "Facing extreme prejudice; Russia's Muslims," *The Economist*. London: May 10, 2003.
- ³⁹ Idrisov U. *Specsluzhby snachala aresovyvayut musul'mann a potom dumayut*. [Special services first arrest Muslims and think afterwars]. <www.islam.ru/01-07-2005/>
- ⁴⁰ Popov V.V. *Rossija namerena prisoedinit'sia k Islamskoj Konfererencii* [Russia intends to join Islamic Conference] - <<http://www.fundarabist.ru/Opinionarabist/Rus@Muslim/Muslim@Russia.htm>>
- ⁴¹ Engelhardt G., Op.cit.
- ⁴² Popov V.V., op. cit.
- ⁴³ Engelhardt G. Op cit.