

Appendix: Hali's revisions

This appendix lists all the revisions made by Hali to the text of the First Edition (I) when preparing the Second Edition (II). Divergences between the two editions are indicated by bold type in the transliterated verses. Besides comments on the significance of the revisions, full translations of the First Edition version are supplied wherever appropriate.

M5:2

I *Mazallat pai apnī qanā'at vuhī hai*

The strong *mazallat* 'ignominy' is toned down to *tanazzul* 'decline' (also used in M62, M124), which fits better with the theme of decline central to the *Musaddas*:

II *Tanazzul pai apnī qanā'at vuhī hai*

M8:1-4

I *'Arab kuchh na thā ik jazīra-numā thā  
Kī paivand mulkoñ se jis kā judā thā  
Na vo ghair qaumoñ pa charh-kar gayā thā  
Na us par ko'ī ghair farmān-ravā thā*

Arabia was nothing; it was a peninsula, whose connexion with other countries was severed. Neither had it gone to invade other nations, nor did it have any alien ruler set over it.

An exceptionally clumsy piece of scene-setting is revised with some fairly successful retouching, which retains both the basic syntax and the rhyme. The dramatic effect has been enhanced by the rhetorical question inserted into the first line:

II *'Arab jis kā charchā hai ye kuchh vo kyā thā  
Jahān se alag ik jazīra-numā thā  
Zamāne se paivand jis kā judā thā  
Na kishvar-sitān thā na kishvar-kushā thā*

M13:5-6

I *Vo ik but-parastoñ kā tīrath banā thā  
Jahān tīn sau sāth but puj rahā thā*

It had become a place of pilgrimage for idol-worshippers, where three hundred and sixty idols were being worshipped.

The over-precise enumeration of the idols, followed by an awkward singular verb, is dropped to good effect, with a strengthening of the rhyme:

II *Vo tīrath thā ik but-parastoñ kā goyā  
Jahān nām-e haq kā na thā ko'ī joyā*

M17:1

I *Vo Bakr aur Taghlib kā nāmī larā'ī*

Perhaps expecting too much knowledge of pre-Islamic history, *nāmī* 'famous' is altered to *bā-ham* 'internecine', an adjective better emphasizing the perpetual state of civil war amongst the pre-Islamic Arabs:

II *Vo Bakr aur Taghlib kā bā-ham larā'ī*

M17A

This stanza, along with M136A and M250A, is one of the three which were dropped in the Second Edition:

I *Isī tarh ek aur khūn-rez baidā  
'Arab meñ laqab harb-e Dāhis hai jis kā  
Rahā ek muddat tak āpas meñ bar-pā  
Bahā khūn kā har taraf jis meñ daryā  
Sabab us kā likhā hai yih Asma'ī ne  
Kī ghor-daur meñ cherid kā thī kisī ne*

In the same way, another bloody conflict—in Arabia given the title of the War of Dahis—Raged amongst them for a long time, during which a torrent of blood flowed in all directions. Asma'ī has written that it was caused by someone having cheated in a horse race.

Hali provides the following note to the stanza:

This war lasted from 568 to 631. Dahis was a horse who was about to go ahead in a race when someone came in front of him and startled him. This was enough to start a struggle in which whole tribes were slaughtered, and which ended only when some tribes accepted Islam. Asma'ī is the source for most stories of the Jahiliyya period.

All this adds little to the brief reference to horse-racing in the Jahiliyya preserved in M18:2. It may, however, be noted that both *baidā* 'conflict' and *cherid* 'cheating' are 'Hindi' words of the type regularly employed by Hali in his search for 'natural' effects.

M37:1-5

I *Naṣārā ne jis tarh khāyā hai dhokā  
Kī samjhe vo 'Isā ko beṭā khudā kā  
Mujhe tum samajhnā na zinhār aisā  
Miri had se rubā barhānā na merā  
Sab insān hairī jis tarh vāñ sar-figandā*

In the way that the Christians have been misled, so that they consider Jesus to be the son of God—Beware that you never think of me like that. Do not magnify my rank beyond my true limit. Even as all men hang their heads there,...

The very explicit reference to a central difference between Christianity and Islam is considerably toned down in II (where Jesus is at no point referred to by the Muslim name 'Isā, only as *Masihā* 'Messiah', e.g. M21:6). Significant in view of the poem's later emphasis on the overlap between Muslim and European intellectual culture, this revision permits some polishing of the rest of the stanza, with a change to its initial rhyme:

- II *Tum auron kī mānind dhokā na khānā*  
*Kisī ko khudā kā na beṭā banānā*  
*Mirī had se rutba na merā barhānā*  
*Barhā-kar bahut tum na mujh ko ghatānā*  
*Sab insān̄ haiñ vāñ jis tarah sar-figandā*

M41:4

- I *Hoñ farzand-o zan us meñ yā māl-o daulat*

The plural verb goes less well with the alternative copular phrases than the singular:

- II *Ho farzand-o zan us meñ yā mal-o daulat*

M59:3

- I *Musalmān-o zimmi ke sab haq the yaksān*

The rights of Muslim and non-Muslim were all the same.

This exaggerated claim is suitably toned down:

- II *Samajhte the zimmi-o muslim ko yaksān*

M63:1-2

- I *Na hangāma thā garm 'Ibrāniyon̄ kā*  
*Na iqbal̄ yavar thā Nasrāniyon̄ kā*

Neither was the assembly of the Hebrews active, nor did fortune aid the Christians.

This is polished by the elegant use of *vo* and *ye* to contrast past Jewish glories with present Christian triumphs, in keeping with the poem's cyclical view of history:

- II *Na vo daur daura thā 'Ibrāniyon̄ kā*  
*Na ye bakh̄-o iqbal̄ Nasrāniyon̄ kā*

M67:3

- I *Jahān 'ilm-o hikmat kī bharmār hai ab*

Where there is now an abundance of science and learning,

Natural imagery is used to redefine the reasons perceived for the West's present success:

- II *Jahān abr-e rahmat guhar-bār hai ab*

M73:2

- I *Falātūñ ko phir zinda kar-ke dikhāyā*

The rhythm is slightly improved:

- II *Falātūñ ko zinda phir kar dikhāyā*

M75:4

- I *Zirā'at meñ mashhūr-e duniyā hu'e vo*

The word *zirā'at* 'cultivation' overlaps very closely with the preceding *falāhat* 'agriculture', hence its replacement by *siyāhat* 'travelling':

- II *Siyāhat meñ mashhūr-e duniyā hu'e vo*

M78:3-4

- I *Khangālā huā un kā sab bahr-o bar thā*

*Jo Lankā meñ the un kā Barbar meñ ghar thā*

Every ocean and continent had been thoroughly explored by them. Those who were in Lanka had their home in Barbary.

One of Hali's more strained uses of 'Hindi' vocabulary, the opening *khangālā* 'washed' is toned down to the more familiar *chhānā* 'sifted'. The alteration of the rhythmically awkward sequence ...*meñ the, un kā...* may be compared with similar adjustments made in the two stanzas. The changes seem to have been prompted by the desire to achieve a more natural rhythmic expression around the exotic geographical names which are so prominent a feature of this part of the poem:

- II *Tamām un kā chhānā huā bahr-o bar thā*

*Jo Lankā meñ derā to Barbar meñ ghar thā*

M79:3

- I *Haiñ Sailūn meñ un ke āsar ab tak*

Here 'Ceylon' (which a note explains is synonymous with Lanka) merely repeats the 'Lanka' of M78:4, so the geographical range is extended eastwards at the same time as improving the rhythm:

- II *Malāyā meñ haiñ un ke āsar ab tak*

M80:5-6

- I *Tumheñ Koh-e Adam se tā Koh-e Baiṭā*

*Milegā jahān jā'oge khoj un kā*

The familiar second person pronoun *tumheñ* is dropped, and the rhythm is adjusted around the geographical names, thus maintaining a rather grander style:

- II *Sar-e Koh-e Adam se tā Koh-e Baiṭā*

*Jahān jā'oge khoj pā'oge un kā*

M82:6

- I *Main hūñ is zamīn par 'Arab kī nishānī*

The same elements are rhythmically re-ordered:

- II *'Arab kī hūñ main is zamīn par nishānī*

M84:4

- I *Vo ujṛā huā karr-o far jā-ke dekhe*

Let him go and see that ruined glory and majesty.

The revised version dwells more tellingly upon Spain's vanished Islamic past:

- II *Khilāfat ko zer-o zabar jā-ke dekhe*

M85:1-6

- I *Vo mashhūr pā-takht 'Abbāsiyōn kā  
Lab-e Dījla ur̄tā thā jis kā pharērā  
Tar-o khushk par jis kā partā thā sāya  
'Irāq-e 'Arab jis pai thā fakhr kartā  
Hu'ī sar-nigūn jis kī muddat se jhandī  
Hai jo āj kal ik tijārat kī mandī*

That famous capital of the Abbasids, whose standard flew on the banks of the Tigris,  
Whose shadow fell on sea and land, upon which Iraq used to pride itself,  
Whose flag has long been lowered, which is nowadays a commercial market.

The stanza (with its 'Hindi' words *pharērā, jhandī, mandī*) reads very awkwardly, with a descent into bathos in the last two lines. It has been successfully remodelled in a grander Persian style, now ending with an effective natural reference to the historical impact of the Mongol conquest as a 'flood':

- II *Vo balda ki fakhr-e bilād-e jahān thā  
Tar-o khushk par jis kā sikka ravān thā  
Garā jis meñ 'Abbāsiyōn kā nishān thā  
'Irāq-e 'Arab jis se rashk-e jinān thā  
Urā le ga'ī bād-e pindār jis ko  
Bahā le ga'ī sail-e Tātār jis ko*

M114:5-6

- I *Ki kal fakhr thā jin se Hindostān ko  
Hu'e āj sab nang-e Hindostān vo*

That those in whom India took pride yesterday have today become India's shame.

The contrast between the glorious past of Islam outside India and the inglorious present of Indian Islam is—tellingly—drawn more pointedly:

- II *Ki kal fakhr thā jin se ahl-e jahān ko  
Lagā un se 'aib āj Hindostān ko*

M118:5

- I *Khuros aur shahbāz sab auj par hain*

It is explained in a note that 'cock' and 'falcon' mean the ruled and the rulers. Although a Persian word, *khuros* 'cock' lacks the poetic connotations of the *chakor*:

- II *Chakor aur shahbāz sab auj par hain*

M133:3

- I *Hain duniyā meñ aise ki goyā nahin hain*

The rewording is rhythmically superior:

- II *Jahān meñ hain aise ki goyā nahin hain*

M134:5-6

- I *Na fāriḡ hain ta'īm-e aulād se vo  
Na ghāfil hain susti-e bunyād se vo*

Neither are they careless of their children's education, nor are they heedless of the feebleness of their base.

The rather vague expression *susti-e bunyād* is replaced by a familiar Muslim perception of the determined progress of the Hindus under British rule:

- II *Na fāriḡ hain aulād kī tarbiyat se  
Na be-fikr hain qaum kī taqviyat se*

M135:6

- I *Unhīn ke hain aufis unhīn ke hain daftar*

The carefully pointed 'English' pronunciation is replaced by the usual Urdu spelling of the loanword:

- II *Unhīn ke hain āfis unhīn ke hain daftar*

M136A

Another stanza which was to be dropped, perhaps because Hali considered that a sufficiently stark picture had already been presented of the decline of the Muslims in relation to other Indian communities:

- I *Tabī'at meñ ek ik kī hai khāksārī  
Burā sun-ke karte hain vo burd-bārī  
Tavāzu' hai jis kī rag-o pai meñ sārī  
Dimāḡh un ke hain kibr-o nakhvāt se 'ārī  
Na bāton meñ un kī haqārat kisī kī  
Na jalson meñ un ke mazammāt kisī kī*

In their nature each one of them possesses humility. When they hear evil, they practise tolerance.

With humbleness in every fibre of their being, their brains are devoid of arrogance.

In their speech there is no contempt for anyone, nor is anyone reviled in their assemblies.

M174:5

- I *Dilon kī umangēn umīdon kī khushyān*

There is a minor adjustment:

- II *Dilon kī umīdeñ umangoñ kī khushyān*

M178:6

- I *Ye hain un kī armān ye hain un kī khushyān*

A similar minor adjustment:

- II *Ye hain un kī khushyān ye hain un kī armān*

M187:1-2

- I *Barhe jis se nafrat vo tahrir karni*  
*Jigar jis se shaq hon vo taqrir karni*

Another reversal of individual words:

- II *Barhe jis se nafrat vo taqrir karni*  
*Jigar jis se shaq hon vo tahrir karni*

M193:6

- I *Kiyā us ko bālu'a ghust-e vuzū kā*

The Arabic word *bālu'a* 'washing sink', requiring the gloss *jā-e shust-o shū*, was perhaps felt to be too unusual a term, hence the rewriting as:

- II *Kiyā qullatain us ko ghust-e vuzū kā*

M195:2

- I *Na hon sidhi sadi rivayat se khush ham*

The colloquial *sidhi sadi*, involving the Persian adjective *sada* being given a feminine ending, is eliminated for the maintenance of a more elevated style:

- II *Kabhi hon na sidhi rivayat se khush ham*

M201:5

- I *Na thik us ki hargiz ko'i bat samjho*  
 Never think anything he says is right.

This very flat expression is given more force:

- II *Mukhalif ki uli har ik bat samjho*

M209:4

- I *Har ik qaum ke dil se vahshat nikali*

Perhaps the word *vahshat* 'craziness' was felt to be inappropriate, even though *nafrat* has already been used earlier in the stanza:

- II *Har ik qaum ke dil se nafrat nikali*

M210:5

- I *Nahin dast-yab aise ab do musalmān*

Slightly softened in the revised version:

- II *Nahin dast-yab aise ab das musalmān*

M211:4

- I *Gham-e qaum men sina-afgar hote*

In grief for the nation our breasts should be wounded.

The word *qaum* is less affectively suggestive of closeness than '*azizān* 'dear ones':

- II *'Azizān ke gham men dil-afgar hote*

M214:3

- I *Hai bazar un ka kharā yā ki khotā*

A rhythmic re-ordering of the type noted under M78:3-4 above, the revision avoids too great a parallelism with the following ...*jhūtā ki sachichā*:

- I *Kharā un ka bazar hai yā ki khotā*

M217:6

- I *Khataktā hai kāntā sā ānkhoñ men sab kā*

A minor alteration to:

- II *Khataktā hai kāntā sā nazroñ men sab kā*

M227:6

- I *Khalifon se larū thi ek ek burhyā*

The quarrel was, strictly speaking, only with the one Caliph Umar, and the inflection of the word *khalifa* is also rather colloquial, hence:

- II *Khalifa se larū thi ek ek burhyā*

M228:1

- I *Nabi ne kahā thā jinhen fakhr-e ummat*

An unduly long sequence of relative clauses is avoided with:

- II *Nabi ne kahā thā unhen fakhr-e ummat*

M232-M256

The three parts of this passage originally appeared in a different order:

- |                     |                        |
|---------------------|------------------------|
| I 249-256 on poetry | II 232-245 on learning |
| 246-248 on medicine | 246-248 on medicine    |
| 232-245 on learning | 249-256 on poetry      |

This is Hali's most substantial revision to his first version.

M234:5

- I *Jamī hain dilon men Aristū ki rā'en*

The opinions of Aristotle are fixed in their hearts.

The name of Aristotle is dropped here, since it is more effectively introduced in the revised version of M235:3:

- II *Dilon men hain naqsh ahl-e Yūnān ki rā'en*

M235:2-4

- I *Shifā ke hain sab jin ko az-bar maqāle*

*Jinon ne Majisū pa dere hain dāle*

*Havāshī hain Tajrid ke sab khangāle*

Those who have all the treatises of the *Shifā* by heart,  
 Who have pitched their tents upon the *Almagest*, who have  
 gone minutely through the margins of the *Tajrid*.

Hali's note explains that the *Tajrid* is a work by Nasir ud Din Tusi. The reference to it is dropped in the revised version, where the rhyme of M235:1 is

used to develop a more symmetrical treatment, while dropping the 'Hindi' verb *khangālnā* (also dropped from M78:3, although retained in M92:3):

- II *Shifā aur Majistī ke dam bharne vāle*  
*Aristū ki chaukhat par sar dharne vāle*  
*Falātūn ki iqtidā karne vāle*

M241:4

- I *Usī rāh par par liyā galla sārā*

The rhyme is slightly strengthened by reversing the last two words:

- II *Usī rāh par par liyā sārā gallā*

M250A

The third of the stanzas dropped in II, perhaps as having been felt too exaggerated, now that the section on poetry appears in a different place:

- I *Sukhan jo hai yahān āj hissa hamārā*  
*Nahīn qaum ko zāhirā jis se chāra*  
*Har ik kizb-o buhtān se jis meṅ gavārā*  
*Mujassam ho us kā agar jhūt sārā*  
*Bane Hind meṅ us se aur ik Himālā*  
*Himālā se jis kā choṅṅ dubālā*

From the poetry which is now our portion, which is clearly of no use to the nation,

In which very lie and slander is approved, even though it is entirely constructed of falsehood,

There has been built another Himalaya in India, whose peak is twice as high as the real Himalaya.

M284:6

- I *Na rastoṅ meṅ qazzāq-o rahzan kā khatkā*

Perhaps felt to be too mechanical a contrast with the preceding *Na ghar meṅ...*, hence changed to:

- II *Na bāhar hai qazzāq-o rahzan kā khatkā*

## GLOSSARY