Appendix: Hali's revisions

This appendix lists all the revisions made by Hali to the text of the First Edition (I) when preparing the Second Edition (II). Divergences between the two editions are indicated by bold type in the transcribed verses. Besides comments on the significance of the revisions, full translations of the First Edition version are supplied wherever appropriate.

M5:2
I Magzillat pai apni qan'at vuli hai

The strong magzillat 'ignominious' is toned down to tanazzul 'decline' (also used in M62, M124), which fits better with the theme of decline central to the Misaadat:

II Tanazzul pai apni qan'at vuli hai

M8:1-4
I 'Arab kuchh na thá ik jazira-numá thá
   Ki paivand mulkon se js ká judá thá
   Na vo gha'ir qaumon pa charch-kar gayá thá
   Na us par ko 'i gha'ir fardán-ravá thá

Arabia was nothing; it was a peninsula, whose connexion with other countries was severed.
Neither had it gone to invade other nations, nor did it have any alien ruler set over it.
An exceptionally clumsy piece of scene-setting is revised with some fairly successful retouching, which retains both the basic syntax and the rhyme. The dramatic effect has been enhanced by the rhetorical question inserted into the first line:

II 'Arab js ká charchhá hai ye kuchh vo kyá thá
   Jahan se alag ik jazira-numá thá
   Zamáne se paivand js ká judá thá
   Na kishvar-sitáh thá na kishvar-kushá thá

M13:5-6
I Vo ik bur-parastón ká tirtha bandá thá
   Jahan tín saw sahh but puh rahá thá

It had become a place of pilgrimage for idol-worshippers, where three hundred and sixty idols were being worshipped.
The over-precise enumeration of the idols, followed by an awkward singular verb, is dropped to good effect, with a strengthening of the rhyme:

II Vo tirtha thá ik bur-parastón ká goyá
   Jahan nám-e haq ká na thá ko't joyá

Appendix

M17:1
I Vo Bakr aur Taghilb kí námi laq'í

Perhaps expecting too much knowledge of pre-Islamic history, námi 'famous' is altered to bá-ham 'intercinece', an adjective better emphasizing the perpetual state of civil war amongst the pre-Islamic Arabs:

II Vo Bakr aur Taghilb kí bá-ham laq'í

M17A
This stanza, along with M136A and M250A, is one of the three which were dropped in the Second Edition:

I Is tahr ek ar khán-rez báidá
   'Arab men lujah hár-bé Dáhis hai js ká
   Rahá ek muddát tak ápas men bár-pá
   Bahá khán ká har taraf js men daryá
   Sabab us ká likhá hai yih Asma'í ne
   Ki ghur-daur men chendá kí ith kast ne

In the same way, another bloody conflict—in Arabia given the title of the War of Dáhis—
Raged amongst them for a long time, during which a torrent of blood flowed in all directions.
Asma'í has written that it was caused by someone having cheated in a horse race.

Hali provides the following note to the stanza:
This war lasted from 568 to 631. Dáhis was a horse who was about to go ahead in a race when someone came in front of him and startled him. This was enough to start a struggle in which whole tribes were slaughtered, and which ended only when some tribes accepted Islam. Asma'í is the source for most stories of the Jahiliyya period.
All this adds little to the brief reference to horse-racing in the Jahiliyya preserved in M18:2. It may, however, be noted that both báidá 'conflict' and chendá 'cheating' are 'Hindi' words of the type regularly employed by Hali in his search for 'natural' effects.

M37:1-5
I Nasárá ne js tahr kháyá hai dhokká
   Ki samjhe vo 'Isá ko bégá khdá ká
   Muje to samajhá na zinhár aísa
   Mír íd más se rabad bárhándá na merá
   Sab insáh haií js tahr váñ sar-fíndá

In the way that the Christians have been misled, so that they consider Jesus to be the son of God—
Beware that you never think of me like that. Do not magnify my rank beyond my true limit.
Even as all men hang their heads there,
The very explicit reference to a central difference between Christianity and Islam is considerably toned down in II (where Jesus is at no point referred to by the Muslim name 'Isa, only as Mustah 'Messiah', e.g. M21:6). Significant in view of the poem's later emphasis on the overlap between Muslim and European intellectual culture, this revision permits some polishing of the rest of the stanza, with a change to its internal rhyme:

II Tum auron kā mārind dhokā na khānā
     Kisi ko khudā kā na betā barānā
     Mīri hād se rueba na merā baghānā
     Baghā-kar bahut tum na mujh ko ghātānā
     Sab inān hain vān jī re tātā sār-fīānā

M41:4

I Hār farzand-o zan us men yā māl-o daulat
The plural verb goes less well with the alternative copular phrases than the singular:

II Hō farzand-o zan us men yā māl-o daulat

M59:3

I Musalmān-o zimmā ke sab haq the yaksān
The rights of Muslim and non-Muslim were all the same.
This exaggerated claim is suitably toned down:

II Samajh the zimmā-o muslim ko yaksān

M63:1-2

I Na hāngāma thā garm 'Ibrānīyon kā
     Na iqbāl yāvar thā Nasrānīyon kā
Neither was the assembly of the Hebrews active, nor did fortune aid the Christians.
This is polished by the elegant use of vo and ye to contrast past Jewish glories with present Christian triumphs, in keeping with the poem's cyclical view of history:

II Na vo daur daura thā 'Ibrānīyon kā
     Na ye bakht-o iqbāl Nasrānīyon kā

M67:3

I Jahnā 'ilm-o hikmat ki bharmār hai ab
Where there is now an abundance of science and learning.
Natural imagery is used to redefine the reasons perceived for the West's present success:

II Jahnā abr-e rahmat guhar-bār hai ab

M73:2

I Falātīn ko phir zinda kar-ke dikhāyā
The rhythm is slightly improved:

II Falātīn ko zinda phir kar dikhāyā

210

Appendix

M75:4

I Zirā'at men mashhār-e dunyā hu'e vo
The word zirā'at 'cultivation' overlaps very closely with the preceding falāḥat 'agriculture', hence its replacement by siyāhāt 'travelling':

II Siyāhāt men mashhār-e dunyā hu'e vo

M78:3-4

I Khangālā huā un kā sab baḥr-o bar thā
     Jo Lankā men the un kā Bābar men ghar thā
Every ocean and continent had been thoroughly explored by them. Those who were in Lanka had their home in Barbary.
One of Hali's more strained uses of 'Hindi' vocabulary, the opening khangālā 'washed' is toned down to the more familiar chhānā 'sifted'. The alteration of the rhythmically awkward sequence . . .men the, un kā... may be compared with similar adjustments made in the two stanzas. The changes seem to have been prompted by the desire to achieve a more natural rhythmical expression around the exotic geographical names which are so prominent a feature of this part of the poem:

II Tamām un kā chhānā huā baḥr-o bar thā
     Jo Lankā men dērā to Bārbar men ghar thā

M79:3

I Hān Sallīn men un ke asār ab tak
Here 'Ceylon' (which a note explains is synonymous with Lanka) merely repeats the 'Lanka' of M78:4, so the geographical range is extended eastwards at the same time as improving the rhythm:

II Malikāy men hála un ke asār ab tak

M80:5-6

I Tumhen Koh-e Ādam se tā Koh-e Baizā
     Milegā jahnā jā'oge khoj un kā
The familiar second person pronoun tumhen is dropped, and the rhythm is adjusted around the geographical names, thus maintaining a rather grander style:

II Sar-e Koh-e Ādam se tā Koh-e Baizā
     Jahnā jā'oge khoj pā'oge un kā

M82:6

I Main hūn is zamīn par 'Arab ki nishānī
The same elements are rhythmically re-ordered:

II 'Arab ki hūn main is zamīn par nishānī

M84:4

I Vo ughā huā karr-o far jā-ka dekhe
Let him go and see that ruined glory and majesty.
The revised version dwells more tellingly upon Spain's vanished Islamic past:

II Khilāfāt ko zer-o zabar jā-ka dekhe
Vo mashhūr pā-takht 'Abbāsiyoun kā
Lab-e Dījā urṭā thā jis kā pharerā
Tur-o ḥuṣhik par jis kā pārthā thā sāya
'Īraq-e 'Arab jis pāi thā fahhr kartā
Ha't sar-nigān jis kī muddat se hāndī
Hai jō āj kal ik tiṭārat kī māndī

That famous capital of the Abbasids, whose standard flew on
the banks of the Tigris,
Whose shadow fell on sea and land, upon which Iraq used
to pride itself,
Whose flag has long been lowered, which is nowadays a
commercial market.

The stanza (with its 'Hindi' words pharerā, hāndī, māndī) reads very awkwardly,
with a descent into bathos in the last two lines. It has been successfully
remodelled in a grander Persian style, now ending with an effective natural
reference to the historical impact of the Mongol conquest as a 'flood':

Vo bālā kī fahhr-e bīldā-e jahān thā
Tur-o ḥuṣhik par jis kā sikkā ravan thā
Garā jis men 'Abbāsiyoun kā nishān thā
'Īraq-e 'Arab jis se rashk-e jinān thā
Urṭā le gat bād-e pindār jis ko
Bahā le gat sat-e Tūtār jis ko

Kī kal fahhr thā jīn se Hindostān kā
Hu'e āj sab nang-e Hindostān vo

That those in whom India took pride yesterday have today
become India’s shame.

The contrast between the glorious past of Islam outside India and the inglorious
present of Indian Islam is—tellingly—drawn more pointedly:

Kī kal fahhr thā jīn se ahi-e jahān kō
Lagā un se 'aib āj Hindostān kō

Khuroz aur shahbāz sab aui par hain
It is explained in a note that 'cock' and 'falcon' mean the ruled and the rulers.
Although a Persian word, Khuroz 'cock' lacks the poetic connotations of the
chakor:

Chakor aur shahbāz sab aui par hain

Hain dunyā men aise kī goyā nahīn hain
The rewording is rhythmically superior:

Jahān men hain aise kī goyā nahīn hain

Na fārīgh hain tālim-e aulād se vo
Na ḹīfīl hain susī-e bīnūdād se vo
Neither are they careless of their children's education, nor
are they needless of the feebleness of their base.
The rather vague expression susī-e bīnūdād is replaced by a familiar Muslim
perspective of the determined progress of the Hindus under British rule:

Na fārīgh hain aulād ki tarkhāyat se
Na be-fīsār hain qaum ki tāqviyāt se

Unhtī ke hain aifs unhtī ke hain daftar
The carefully pointed 'English' pronunciation is replaced by the usual Urdu
spelling of the loanword:

Unhtī ke hain aifs unhtī ke hain daftar

Another stanza which was to be dropped, perhaps because Hali considered that
a sufficiently stark picture had already been presented of the decline of the Muslims in relation to other Indian communities:

Tabītāt men ek ik kī hai khaḵāṣār
Burā sun-ke hain vo burāhtār
Tavāṭū hais jis ki ṭag-o pāi men sāti
Dimāgh un ke hain kib-o nakhyāt se 'ārt
Na bāton men un ki haqārāt kisi kī
Na jahān men un ki mażāmāt kisi kī
In their nature each one of them possesses humility. When
they hear evil, they practise tolerance.
With humbleness in every fibre of their being, their brains are
devoid of arrogance.
In their speech there is no contempt for anyone, nor is
anyone reviled in their assemblies.

Dīlōn ki umangēn umīdān kī khusyān
There is a minor adjustment:

Dīlōn ki umīdān umangēn kī khusyān

Ye hain un kī armañān ye hain un kī khusyān
A similar minor adjustment:

Ye hain un kī khusyān ye hain un kī armañān
Appendix

M214:3
I  Hai bāzār un kā kharā yā kī khojā
A rhythmic re-ordering of the type noted under M78:3-4 above, the revision avoids too great a parallelism with the following... jhātā ki sachīchā:
II  Kharā un kā bāzār hai yā kī khojā

M217:6
I  Khāṭaka hai kāntā sā ānkhon men sab kā
A minor alteration to:
II  Khāṭaka hai kāntā sā nazar men sab kā

M227:6
I  Khallīfān se latī thi ek ek burhān
The quarrel was, strictly speaking, only with the one Caliph Umar, and the inflection of the word khallīfā is also rather colloquial, hence:
II  Khallīfā se lati thi ek ek burhān

M228:1
I  Nabh ne kahā thi jinhēn fakhār-e ummat
An unduly long sequence of relative clauses is avoided with:
II  Nabh ne kahā thi jinhēn fakhār-e ummat

M232-M256
The three parts of this passage originally appeared in a different order:
I  249-256 on poetry   II  232-245 on learning
246-248 on medicine   246-248 on medicine
232-245 on learning   249-256 on poetry

This is Hali's most substantial revision to his first version.

M234:5
I  Jami haih dilon meh Aristō kā rā'ēn
The opinions of Aristotle are fixed in their hearts.
The name of Aristotle is dropped here, since it is more effectively introduced in the revised version of M235:3:
II  Dilon meh haih naqsh ahl-e Yūnān kī rā'ēn

M235:2-4
I  Shīfā ke haih sab jin ko az-bar maqāle
Jinhōn ne Majūsī pa gher haih dīlē
Havādār haih Tajīrd ke sab khaṅgāle
Those who have all the treatises of the Shīfā by heart,
Who have pitched their tents upon the Almages, who have
gone minutely through the margins of the Tajīrd.
Hali's note explains that the Tajīrd is a work by Nasīr ud Din Tusi. The
reference to it is dropped in the revised version, where the rhyme of M235:1 is
Hali's Musaddas

used to develop a more symmetrical treatment, while dropping the 'Hindi' verb khaṇḍāṅā (also dropped from M78:3, although retained in M92:3):

II

Shīfā aur Majīfī ke dam bharne vāle
Aristū ki chaukhat par sar dharne vāle
Fatāīn ki lqtīdā karne vāle

M241:4

I  Ģust rāh par par liyā gallā sārā
The rhyme is slightly strengthened by reversing the last two words:

II  Ģust rāh par par liyā sārā gallā

M250A

The third of the stanzas dropped in II, perhaps as having been felt too exaggerated, now that the section on poetry appears in a different place:

I  Sukhān jo hai yahān āj hiśā hamārā
   Nahin qaum ko zahirā āj se chārā
   Har ik kizb-o buhtān se āj se mēn gavārā
   Muqāssam ho us kā āqār jhāt sārā
   Bane Hind meh us se aur ik Hindālā
   Hindālā se āj āj ki choṭī dubālā
From the poetry which is now our portion, which is clearly of no use to the nation,
In which very lie and slander is approved, even though it is entirely constructed of falsehood,
There has been built another Himalaya in India, whose peak is twice as high as the real Himalaya.

GLOSSARY

M284:6

I  Na rastān meh gazzāq-o raḥzan kā khaṭkā
Perhaps felt to be too mechanical a contrast with the preceding Na ghar meh..., hence changed to:

II  Na bāhar hai gazzāq-o raḥzan kā khaṭkā