I owe thanks to many people over the years for helping me with the learning, research and writing that eventually led to this book. For my formal academic training in Hindi and Urdu I am indebted to: Dr Manindra Verma, Dr Usha Nilsson and Dr G. C. Narang at the University of Wisconsin; Dr Bruce Pray at the University of California, Berkeley; and Dr K. K. Mishra and Dr H. C. Nayyar at Banaras Hindu University. For my less formal but equally valuable language learning I must thank: the students of Birla Hostel at Banaras Hindu University during 1966–67 for patiently listening to my initially halting attempts to speak Hindi and furnishing me with many hours of conversation; many Indian friends and acquaintances who provided me with practice; Shri Kailash Nath Chaube who became not just my Hindi tutor but also a good friend; and especially the many people of India whose pleasure in my attempts to communicate with them sustained my efforts. Thanks to these many teachers all translations in this book, including any mistakes, are my own.

I am also grateful to many other people and institutions who helped me in a variety of ways: the Fulbright Foundation for giving me a year in Banaras to learn Hindi and Urdu; the Foreign Area Fellowship Program, and especially my interviewer Barney Cohn, for supporting my dissertation research in the United States, England, and India; the India Office Library for countless hours of research in comfortable surroundings, and especially Alf and Fred; the University of Windsor for a sabbatical year in India; Frank Conlon, Chris Bayly, and several others who helped guide me in the mysteries of finding materials in the IOL; the Nagar Pracharini Sabha of Banaras and its Pradhan Mantri Shri Sudhakar Pandey for providing a treasure house of information, and especially the late Shri Sadanand Shastri and Shambhunath Vaipeyi whose memories I cherish; my dissertation adviser and well-wisher at the University of Wisconsin, Bob Frykenberg; Jim Nye of the University of Chicago and Jerry Barrier of the University of Missouri; my research assistants Shri Ibadur Rahman Ansari and Shri Vidya Nath Chaube, my frequent host Shri Chandra Prakash, and my several informants, especially the late Shri Ray Krishna Das, all of Banaras; and my publishers, Oxford University Press, India. To Leela, my wife, my gratitude beyond measure.
vi One Language, Two Scripts

I have long thought that each book which purports to describe and analyse complex human affairs should include a 'statement of bias' or perhaps better, a 'statement of perspective' from the author so that readers can know something of the values and attitudes that lie behind the often impersonal-seeming text. I have done this to some extent in Chapter I, and to a greater extent in Chapter VI, but something more personal seems appropriate here. Very briefly, I value Hindi and Urdu equally, but have more acquaintance with and more facility in the former. I have a strong distaste for extremists on either side of an artificially created linguistic divide. I cannot but feel that such extremism rests on a basic intolerance of differences, whether they are linguistic or religious, which threatens to destroy the unity in diversity which is India at its best. Let me say with Kabir that:

For Muslims in mosques and for Hindus in temples
both Khuda and Ram are there;
Where mosque and temple do not exist
who is it that rules supreme there?

Windsor, Ontario
December 1993

Contents

Preface v
Tables ix
Chronology x
Transliteration Scheme xii

I Introduction 1
Theoretical Background 1
Historical Background 4
Linguistic and Social Background 7
Recent Studies 11
The Present Study 13
Main Themes and Precis 15
Notes 19

II The Development of Differentiation 23
Introduction 23
The Early Literary History of Urdu and Hindi 24
The College of Fort William 25
Early Nineteenth Century Prose Writers in Hindi and Urdu 28
Later Writers in Hindi and Urdu Prose 29
The Language of Poetry: Braj Bhasha vs. Khari Boli 33
Patterns of Publishing: Languages 37
Patterns of Publishing: Geographical 41
Conclusion 47
Notes 49

III Government Language Policy 53
Introduction 53
The Replacement of Persian 54
Indian Reactions to the Replacement of Persian 58
The Nagari Script in the Saugor and Nerbudda Territories 60
The Persianization of Urdu 63
The Kaithi Script 65
The Nagari Script in the Central Provinces 69
The Nagari and Kaithi Scripts in Bihar 72
An Analysis of Language Policy 75
Notes 79
Tables

1. Trends in the Growth Rates of the Production of Books and Periodicals in the United Provinces, 1868–1925 38
2. Trends in the Growth Rate of Publications in Various Languages in Selected Cities of the United Provinces between 1868 and 1925 43
3. Proportions of Hindi and Urdu Publications in Three Regions of the United Provinces between 1868 and 1925 45
4. Newspaper Circulation in Various Vernaculars in the United Provinces from 1869 to 1900 46
5. Numbers of Non-Official Letters in Hindi, Urdu, and English Received in District and Imperial Post Offices in the NWP&O in the Second Week of December 1875 47
6. Teachers in Persian and Hindi Schools of Agra District c. 1845 96
7. Students in Persian and Hindi Schools of Agra District c. 1845 96
8. Numbers of Students in Language Classes in Different Regions of the NWP in Schools of All Levels in 1860 99
9. Numbers of Students in Language Classes in Different Levels of Schools in the North-Western Provinces in 1860 100
10. Numbers of Students in Language Classes in Different Levels of Schools in the Province of Oudh in 1869 101
11. Castes of Successful Candidates in the Anglo-Vernacular and Vernacular Middle Examinations for 1887 112
12. Proportions of Students of Various Castes Passing the Anglo-Vernacular and Vernacular Middle Examinations for 1887 Compared to their Proportions in the Population in 1881 113
13. Candidates Taking Hindi or Urdu in the Vernacular Middle Examinations from 1874–75 to 1895–96 115
14. Labels of Virtue and Vice for Hindi and Urdu: Hindi Viewpoint 184
15. Labels of Virtue and Vice for Urdu and Hindi: Urdu Viewpoint 184
Chronology

1775  Banaras area ceded to British
1792  Benares Sanskrit College founded
1800  College of Fort William founded
1832  English and vernaculars replace Persian in Presidencies of Bombay and Madras
1835  Shore establishes Nagari in Saugor and Nerbudda Territories
1837  English and vernaculars replace Persian in Bengal Presidency
1839  Petitions against replacement of Persian
1845  Survey of indigenous schools in the NWP
1847  Dr Ballantyne attempts to improve the Hindi of his Benares Sanskrit College students
1852  Board of Revenue of NWP orders Nagari, not Kaithi, for village papers
1865  Anjuman-i-Punjab founded
1867  British Indian Association of the NWP petitions for Vernacular University
1868  Shiva Prasad writes Memorandum against Urdu
1872  Use of Nagari script authorized in Central Provinces
1873  Hindi and Nagari supporters in NWP present memorial to provincial government
1875  Muhammadan Anglo-Oriental College of Aligarh founded, uses Urdu as medium of instruction
1875  Arya Samaj founded, helps to promote Hindi in north India
1877  Government of NWP&O prescribes Middle Class Vernacular and Anglo-Vernacular Examinations for government service, and recognizes Urdu as the superior vernacular language
1880  Nagari and Kaithi made official scripts in Bihar
1882  Hunter Commission serves as focus of linguistic controversy
1882  Memorial of National Muhammadan Association of Calcutta
1887  Khari Boli vs. Braj Bhasha controversy begins
1893  Nagari Pracharini Sabha of Banaras founded
1897  Malaviya publishes Court Character and Primary Education
1898  Central Hindu College of Banaras founded, includes Hindi in curriculum
1898  Delegation of prominent Hindus meets with Lieutenant-Governor of NWP, MacDonnell, to plead for Hindi and Nagari
1900  NWP&O Resolution gives Nagari equal status with Urdu script
1900  Urdu Defence Association of Allahabad publishes A Defence of the Urdu Language and Character
1903  Anjuman Taraqqi-e-Urdu founded
1910  Hindi Sahitya Sammelan founded
1913  UP Committee on Primary Education debates question of proper language for primary readers
1921  Indian National Congress accepts principle of linguistic provinces
1923  Hindi and Urdu become regular degree courses in UP universities
1925  Gandhi persuades Congress to accept Hindustani as official language
1947  Uttar Pradesh adopts Hindi in Devanagari as official state language
1948  Linguistic Provinces Commission report
1950  Constitution of India provides that Hindi become official language in 1965
1952  Creation of linguistic state of Andhra Pradesh
1955  Report of States Reorganization Commission
1965  Official Languages Act gives Hindi status of official language and English status as additional official language
1968  Official Languages (Amendment) Act strengthens status of English
1989  Urdu becomes additional official language of Uttar Pradesh
Transliteration Scheme

For Urdu words, I have used for the most part the system of G. C. Narang in *Urdu: Readings in Literary Urdu Prose* (Madison, Wisconsin: University of Wisconsin Press, 1968). For Hindi words I have used the system of Rupert Snell and Simon Weightman in *Teach Yourself Hindi* (London: Random House, 1989). Where places, personal names, and terms have a commonly-used English spelling (e.g., Varanasi, Shyam Sundar Das, and Nagari) I have not used diacritics.

CHAPTER I

Introduction

We do not clearly understand what you Europeans mean by the term Hindi, for there are hundreds of dialects, all in our opinion equally entitled to the name, and there is here no standard as there is in Sanskrit.¹

The Hindi movement in nineteenth century north India provides an interesting and extremely complex example of the relationships between language, religion, and nationalism. No scholar of modern Indian history would dispute the assertion that language and religion have had an enormous influence on the development of nationalism in South Asia. The creation of Pakistan in 1947, the inauguration of linguistic states in India in 1955, the anti-Hindi agitation in South India in 1965, the emergence of a Punjabi Suba in 1966, the independence of Bangladesh in 1971—these and many other similar events testify to the great importance of these two symbols in recent times. To understand the contemporary manifestations of language and religion, however, one needs to study their earlier expressions by those Indians who used them as the central symbols of competing nationalisms. The Hindi movement of the nineteenth century, copiously documented but little studied outside India, furnishes an excellent opportunity to examine an important aspect of the development of Hindu nationalism in north India.

Theoretical Background

Many scholars have exercised their ingenuity in attempts to create a satisfactory conceptual framework for the pervasive phenomenon of nationalism. One of the most instructive of these attempts appears in the writings of Karl Deutsch, especially his *Nationalism and Social Communication*, where he sets forth the idea of a ‘people’ as a large group characterized by a complementarity of social communication. This complementarity means that members of the group can communicate more effectively over a wider range of subjects with each other than with outsiders. A people struggling to gain control over the behavior of its members becomes a ‘nationality’ which in turn becomes a ‘nation’ once this control has been added to the previously existing cohesiveness and shared symbols.²