Japanese G9040
Graduate Seminar on Premodern Japanese Literature, Spring 2016:

Tsuda Sōkichi vs. Orikuchi Shinobu

Wednesdays 4:10-6:00pm; 522A Kent Hall

David Lurie <DBL11@columbia.edu>
Office Hours: Tues. 2-3 & Thurs. 11-12 in 500C Kent Hall

Course Rationale:
This course treats Tsuda Sōkichi (1873-1961) and Orikuchi Shinobu (1887-1953) as twin titans of twentieth-century scholarship on ancient Japan. In fields as diverse as literature, history of thought, religious studies, mythology, ancient history, poetry, Chinese studies, and drama, their influence remains strong today. Tsuda’s ideas still shape mainstream approaches to Japanese mythology and early historical works, and terms and concepts created by Orikuchi are central to national literary studies (kokubungaku), even if their derivation from his work is often forgotten.

It is hard to imagine two scholars more different in approach and style: Tsuda the systematic, skeptical positivist versus Orikuchi the intuitive, speculative romantic. And yet they repeatedly addressed similar questions and problems, and despite Tsuda’s earlier birth and longer life, their periods of greatest productivity (Taishō to early Shōwa, with important codas in the decade or so after the war) also overlapped. Accordingly this syllabus imagines a dialogue between them by juxtaposing selections from key works.

Because the oeuvres of Tsuda and Orikuchi are so enormous (put together, their collected works reach 75 volumes) and their interests so varied, it is impossible to provide a systematic overview here. The selection is focused on early Japan, and much has been left out, such as Orikuchi’s work on poetry and drama, or Tsuda’s studies of Buddhism and classical Chinese philosophy. Nonetheless, we should end the semester with a rich sense of the texture of their writings and the lasting significance of their thought.

The point is not to look for direct points of contact—influence or disagreement—between them, although it is clear from numerous references that Orikuchi, at least, was reading Tsuda. Neither is this an attempt to flesh out particular moments in modern Japanese intellectual history; to do so would require more sustained attention to the contexts in which they produced and disseminated their scholarship. Rather, our goals are to reconsider the range of possibilities for engagement with early Japanese texts; to familiarize ourselves with the methodological differences foregrounded by this semester-long juxtaposition; and to consider the impact of style and (for want of a better term) taste on a scholar’s body of work.

Prerequisites:
A grounding in kanbun and/or classical Chinese will be enormously helpful, but the only firm prerequisite is solid command of modern and classical Japanese. Note, though, that this is an advanced graduate seminar with extensive readings. Students with concerns about their ability to

1 Orikuchi writes favorably about Tsuda’s Bungaku ni arawaretaru waga kokumin shisō no kenkyū (1916-1921), even providing a short entry about it for the 1937 Sekai bungaku daijiten (OSZ 32:301), but he is less positive about Tsuda’s claims for Chinese influence on early mythological texts. On the other hand, Tsuda’s opinion of Orikuchi’s work is harder to ascertain, because he rarely cites other scholars by name, but the article we will read in Week 3 gives some sense of how he responded, or would have responded, to it in general terms.
keep up should consult with the instructor before registering for the class. A certain degree of familiarity with early Japanese literature will be necessary for most of the readings. Students without prior exposure to Nara period literature are encouraged to read the initial chapters from the *Cambridge History of Japanese Literature* and Borgen and Ury’s classic “Readable Japanese Mythology,” both of which are available on Courseworks. Resources from the bibliography at the end of this syllabus, especially the two Orikuchi encyclopedias, should also be consulted.

**Requirements:**
1) Consistent attendance/participation, including in-class reading and translation of sources.
3) Regular postings about assigned readings (see below).
3) A short final project (see below), due on Monday 16 May.²

**Course Materials:**
Readings from the work of Tsuda and Orikuchi can be found in their respective *zenshū*,³ but editions with more accessible orthography, or with annotations, are used when available. Regardless of the source, all assigned readings will be posted as pdfs on Courseworks. Assigned secondary sources, and selections from classical works discussed by Tsuda and Orikuchi, will also be posted as pdfs on Courseworks. Select volumes from Tsuda’s *zenshū* are on reserve in Starr Library. Orikuchi’s most recent *zenshū* remains down in the library stacks, but has been designated as non-circulating (in its entirety) for the duration of this seminar; **please return any volume you’ve consulted to the shelf when you are finished with it.** (You are free to page and borrow volumes from the older *zenshū* that is held offsite.)

**Postings:**
Each week, students are required to submit a brief posting (approximately 500 words) on Courseworks by midnight on Tuesday. This posting will raise questions about or otherwise respond to some aspect of the reading(s) for that week.

**Final Project:**
Students have three options for the final project: 1) exegesis of a key term or terms; 2) commentary/analysis of a passage from one or more of our readings; 3) a well-annotated translation of sections of a Tsuda or Orikuchi text or texts not addressed in this course, with a brief introduction. The resulting paper is meant to be a short (around 10 pages) analytic exercise, with minimal reliance on secondary sources. Although comparison of Tsuda and Orikuchi is desirable, students are free to focus on one or the other if they prefer to do so. Please keep this project in mind from the beginning of the semester, and consult with me in advance of the brief presentations on work in progress during the final class session (Wednesday 27 April).

---
² **PLEASE NOTE:** In extraordinary circumstances an extension of a few days may be granted but barring medical or family emergencies I will not permit any incompletes in this course.
³ The *Tsuda Sōkichi zenshū* (*TSZ*) was published by Iwanami shoten in 33 volumes in 1963-1966, and then reissued with two additional volumes, for a total of 35, in 1989. Orikuchi’s collected works have a more complex history (on which see the *Chōki/Orikuchi Shinobu jiten* [Benseisha, 2000], pp. 227-233, with parallel tables of contents on pp. 382-440). The old *Orikuchi Shinobu zenshū* (a revision of an earlier version published shortly after Orikuchi’s death) was published in 32 volumes by Chūō kōronsha in 1965-1968, and followed by an additional 24 volumes of lecture notes (*Nōto hen*) in 1970-1974 and 1987-1988. The new *Orikuchi Shinobu zenshū* (**indicated by OSZ in this syllabus**) was published in 40 volumes by Chūō kōronsha from 1995 to 1999; it does not supplant the *Nōto hen*, but otherwise is the version to consult.
Schedule:

1) 20 Jan. Introduction

2) 27 Jan. Retrospection and Methodology
Tsuda: “Gakkyū seikatsu gojūnen” (1951) AND “Jindaishi no kenkyū hō” (1919), from Tsuda Sōkichi rekishiron shū (ed. Imai Osamu, Iwanami bunko, 2006), pp. 5-25 and 62-74
Orikuchi: Afterword (oigaki) to Kodai kenkyū (1930), from Orikuchi Shinobu (Chikuma Nihon bunko, 2008), pp. 348-385

3) 3 Feb. Theories and Critiques of Ethnology
Tsuda: “Nihon jōdaishi no kenkyū ni kansuru ni, san no keikō ni tsuite” (1931), from Tsuda Sōkichi rekishiron shū, pp. 116-135

4) 10 Feb. What is a God?
Orikuchi: “Nihonjin no kami to reikon no kannen sono hoka” (1949 dialogue with Yanagita Kunio), OSZ Bekkan 3:538-585
Tsuda: “Jindaishi no kami ni tsuite” (1954), TSZ 9:415-26 (see also 1966 T’oung Pao English translation)

5) 17 Feb. Other Worlds: Yomi and tokoyo
Orikuchi: “Minzoku shikan ni okeru takai kannen” (1952), OSZ 20:19-72
Tsuda: tokoyo discussion in “Suja Tennō Suinin Tennō nichō no monogatari” AND “Yomi no kuni no monogatari,” from Nihon koten no kenkyū (vol. 1, 1948), TSZ 1:253-255 and 394-409

6) 24 Feb. Literature as Method I: The Rival Princes
•Kojiki account of the sons of Emperor Ōjin (from Philippi translation)
Orikuchi: “Ōyamamori” (1922) from Kodai kan’ai shū (1947), in Ishiuchi Tōru, Shaku Chōkū Kodai kan’ai shū chūshaku: zen (Minato no hito, 2009), pp. 281-353

7) 2 March Literature as Method II: The Book of the Dead
•Edwin Cranston translations of poems related to Prince Ōtsu (Gem-Glistening Cup poem numbers 269-270, 272-277, 872-873)
•Summary of Shisha no sho from the Nihon bungei kanshō jiten vol. 12 (Gyōsei, 1988), pp. 152-160
Orikuchi: Shisha no sho (1943), from Nihon kindai bungaku taikei vol. 46 (Kadokawa shoten,
1972): sections 1-10 (pp. 44-99).^4

8) 9 March The Virtue of Promiscuity (irogonomi no toku)
   • Kojiki accounts of Ōkuninushi and Suseribime and of Nintoku and Iwanohime (from Philippi)
   • Summary of “Suetsumuhana” in Hirose Isako (with translation by Susan Tyler), Genji monogatari nyūmon/An Introduction to the Tale of Genji (1989), pp. 24-27
   Orikuchi: “Man’yōbito no seikatsu” (1922), OSZ 1:307-320 AND discussion of Genji monogatari in general and “Suetsumuhana” in particular from Kokubungaku (1948-1952) [see especially the sections entitled “Genji no irogonomi” and “Irogonomi ron”], OSZ 16:213-241
   Tsuda: chapters on the Heian view of love (ren’aikan) from Bungaku ni arawaretaru waga kokumin shisō no kenkyū: Kizoku bungaku (1916), TSZ bekkan 2:140-145 and 244-262

9) 23 March ‘Chinese Thought’ and its Influence
   Tsuda: “Maegaki” and “Nihon wa Shina shisō o ika ni ukeireta ka” from Shina shisō to Nihon (1938), as revised for inclusion in Rekishigaku to rekishi kyōiku (1959), TSZ 20:195-269

10) 30 March [NO CLASS MEETING] Aspects of Reception and Influence
    Read all of the following articles and write a 1000-word posting about issues raised by one or more of them, to be submitted by 4pm on Wednesday the 30th.

11) 6 April Japanese Origins
    Orikuchi: “Kokubungaku no hassei dai-1-kō” (1924) OSZ 1:67-78 AND “Haha ga kuni e/Tokoyo e” (1920), from Orikuchi Shinobu (Chikuma Nihon bungaku 25, 2008), pp. 386-402
    Tsuda: “Josetsu,” Bungaku ni arawaretaru waga kokumin shisō no kenkyū: Kizoku bungaku (1916), TSZ bekkan 2:25-51

^4 When Shisha no sho was first published in 1939 (in three installments in the journal Nihon hyōron) the sections were ordered thusly: 6, 7, 3, 4 (part 1); 1, 2, 5, 8-10 (part 2); 11-20 (part 3). Our selection corresponds to parts 1 and 2 of the original (which Orikuchi extensively revised as well as re-ordering), but students are encouraged to read the rest of the novel if they have time.
12) 13 April The Itinerant Sources of Japanese Literature
Orikuchi: Selections from Nihon bungaku no hassei: josetsu (1947): “Shōsetsu gikyoku bungaku ni okeru monogatari yōso,” “Bungaku to kyōen to,” and “Ijin to bungaku to”; OSZ 4:196-266

13) 20 April The Structure of Japanese Mythology
Tsuda: Jindaishi no atarashii kenkyū (1913), chapters 1, 2, and 5; TSZ bekkan 1:34-98, 144-152

14) 27 April Postwar Reform of Shintō
[session starts with brief presentations about final projects]
Tsuda: “Kenkoku no jijō to bansei ikkei no shisō” (1946), from Tsuda Sōkichi rekishiron shū (ed. Imai Osamu, Iwanami bunko, 2006), pp. 278-323 (note that there is a 1963 English translation of the revised version of this article that was included in Nihon jōdaishi no kenkyū [1947])

Orikuchi: “Shinwa 2” (reconstruction of 1946 lecture), Orikuchi Shinobu zenshū Nōto hen tsuiho 1 (Chūō kōronsha, 1987), pp. 317-327 AND “Shintō” (1951), OSZ 20:348-359

FINAL PAPER DUE: Monday 16 May
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1873</td>
<td>born in Minokamo, Gifu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1887</td>
<td>born in Kizumura, Osaka (Imamiya area, west of Shitennoji)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1891</td>
<td>graduates from Tokyo Senmon Gakkō (=Waseda)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1896</td>
<td>becomes middle school teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1908</td>
<td>joins the research bureau (Mansen rekishi chiri chōsabu) of the South Manchurian Railway Company (Mantetsu) under Shiratori Kurakichi (1865-1942)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1910</td>
<td>graduates from Kokugakuin University (kokabungaku)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1913</td>
<td><em>Jindaishi no atarashii kenkyū; Chōsen rekishi chiri</em> start of friendship with Yanagita Kunio (1875-1962); essay published in Kyōdo kenkyū</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1916</td>
<td><em>Bungaku ni arawaretaru waga kokumin shisō no kenkyū</em> (publication continues to 1921) <em>Kōyaku Man'yōshū</em> (vols. 2 and 3 published 1917)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1918</td>
<td>lecturer at Waseda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1919</td>
<td><em>Kojiki oyobi Nihon shoki no shin kenkyū</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1920</td>
<td>professor at Waseda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1921</td>
<td>first trip to Okinawa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1922</td>
<td>professor at Kokugakuin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1923</td>
<td>lecturer at Keio University; second trip to Okinawa; walks from Yokohama to Tokyo a few days after the Great Kantō Earthquake</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1924</td>
<td><em>Jindaishi no kenkyū; Kojiki oyobi Nihon shoki no kenkyū</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1925</td>
<td><em>Umia no aida</em> (tanka collection); “Kodai seikatsu no kenkyū” <em>(Kaizō)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1926</td>
<td>“Uta no enjaku suru toki” <em>(Kaizō)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1929</td>
<td><em>Kodai kenkyū</em> (Minzokugaku hen 1 and Kokubungaku hen; Minzokugaku hen 2 published 1930)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1930</td>
<td><em>Nihon jōdaishi kenkyū</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1933</td>
<td><em>Jōdai Nihon no shakai oyobi shisō</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1935</td>
<td>criticized by Yamagita (“Kyōdo kenkyū no seichō”); third trip to Okinawa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1939</td>
<td><em>Shisha no sho</em> serialized <em>(Nihon hyōron; book published in 1943)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1940</td>
<td>resigns post at Waseda; several of his studies of ancient Japan are banned, and along with publisher Iwanami Shigeo (1881-1946) he is prosecuted for lèse-majesté</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1943</td>
<td>Arahitogami incident</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1945</td>
<td>leaves Tokyo for Hiraizumi (until 1950)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1946</td>
<td>refuses appointment as president of Waseda; named Professor Emeritus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1947</td>
<td><em>Nihon jōdaishi no kenkyū</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1948</td>
<td><em>Nihon koten no kenkyū</em> (vol. 2 published 1950)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1949</td>
<td><em>Nihon no shintō</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1950</td>
<td><em>Nihon bungaku keimō</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1951</td>
<td><em>Bungaku ni arawaretaru kokumin shisō no kenkyū</em> (vol. 1; publication continues; last, posthumous volume in 1965)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1953</td>
<td>dies in Tokyo (aged 66)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1959</td>
<td><em>Rekishigaku to rekishi kyōiku</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1961</td>
<td>dies in Tokyo (aged 88)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Bibliography

I) On Tsuda

A) Studies in English


B) Translations and articles originally published in English

“On the Dates when the Li-chi and Ta-tai Li-chi Were Edited.” Memoirs of the Tōyō bunko 6 (1932):77-112.


(Translation of “Tōyō bunka to wa nani ka,” TSZ 20:269-335.)


C) Selective listing of Japanese-language studies


II) On Orikuchi

A) Studies in English


**B) Translations into English**


Emswiler and David Gundry.)
Gessel, eds., The Columbia Anthology of Modern Japanese Literature Volume 1: From
485-493. (Translation of the first two chapters of Shisha no sho.)
1996. (Short collecti
on of tanka by Orikuchi [Shaku Chōkū], pp. 85-96.)
C) Highly selective listing of Japanese-language studies and collections
[NOTE: There is a tremendous amount of material on Orikuchi’s life and work. For good
overviews up to the late 1990s, consult the two encyclopedias listed immediately below; the
recent thematic paperback volumes from Kōdansha and Iwanami also often contain useful
kaisetsu commentaries and other helpful material]
1) Encyclopedias and Handbooks
2) Annotated Editions and Thematic Collections
Nihon no shiika vol. 11. Chūō kōronsha, 1969. (Unannotated collection of poetry with
running commentary by Katō Morio.)
[1925])
Uta no hanashi/Uta no enjaku suru toki. Iwanami bunko, 2009. (Commentary [kaisetsu]
by Okano Hirohiko.)
Shisha no sho, Kuchibue. Iwanami bunko, 2010. (Notes and commentary by Andō Reiji.)
3) Some Recent Scholarship and Criticism
Fujii Sadakazu. Orikuchi Shinobu no shi no seiritsu: Shikei, tanka, gaku. Chūō kōronsha,
2000.
Gendai shisō 42:7 (2014). (Special issue on Orikuchi.)
Ueno Makoto. Tamashii no kodaigaku: Toitsuzukeru Orikuchi Shinobu. Shinchō sensho,
2008.