

PRIMER NOTE

Isolation and characterization of polymorphic microsatellite loci in the plural cooperatively breeding superb starling, *Lamprotornis superbus*

DUSTIN R. RUBENSTEIN*†

*Cornell University, Department of Neurobiology and Behaviour, Seeley G. Mudd Hall, Ithaca, NY, 14853, USA, †Evolutionary Biology Program, Cornell Laboratory of Ornithology, 159 Sapsucker Woods Road, Ithaca, NY, 14850, USA

Abstract

Superb starlings (*Lamprotornis superbus*) are separate nesting plural cooperative breeders endemic to East Africa that show high levels of reproductive conflict and low reproductive skew. I isolated 31 polymorphic microsatellite loci from the superb starling genome and characterized them in approximately 31 individuals. The numbers of alleles per locus ranged from two to 16 and observed heterozygosities ranged from 0.03 to 0.88. Many of these loci amplified in other passerine species including the European starling, *Sturnus vulgaris*, and a variety of other starlings and mockingbirds.

Keywords: cooperative breeding, microsatellite, paternity, starling, Sturnidae, *Sturnus vulgaris*

Received 2 February 2005; revision received 22 March 2005; accepted 20 April 2005

The superb starling (*Lamprotornis superbus*) is a separate nesting plural cooperative breeder endemic to East Africa. Superb starlings live in social groups of 10–35 individuals with two to six breeding pairs (Fry *et al.* 2000). Birds defend group territories year-round and breed biannually during both the long and short rainy seasons. Here, I report the development of 31 polymorphic microsatellite loci for the superb starling that will be useful for studying sexual conflict, parentage and relatedness as part of a larger study examining the evolution of cooperative breeding in African starlings.

To isolate microsatellite markers, I used a modified enrichment protocol (Hamilton *et al.* 1999) that incorporated magnetic capture of streptavidin beads with biotinylated probes bound to microsatellite-containing genomic fragments (Kijas *et al.* 1994). Blood was collected from superb starlings in Queens lysis buffer (Seutin *et al.* 1991) at study sites at the Mpala Research Centre, Kenya. Using a DNeasy Tissue Kit (QIAGEN), I extracted genomic DNA from three males and three females. Genomic DNA was pooled and digested with two restriction enzymes (*Hinc*II, *Rsa*I) and simultaneously ligated to SNX linker sequences (Hamilton *et al.* 1999). I enriched for dinucleotide repeats with syn-

thetic, single-stranded biotinylated repeats of (CT)₁₅ and (GT)₁₅ and then combined the digests for capture of microsatellite-enriched fragments by binding to streptavidin beads (Dynabeads, Dynal) (Kijas *et al.* 1994). Enriched fragments were made double-stranded by polymerase chain reaction (PCR), digested with *Nhe*I and ligated into *Xba*I-digested, dephosphorylated pUC19 (New England BioLabs). I then transformed the clones into MAX Efficiency DH5 α competent *Escherichia coli* (Invitrogen) and grew them on Luria–Bertani agar plates with ampicillin. Bacterial colonies were transferred to nylon membranes (MagnaLift; GE Osmonics), hybridized with (CT)₁₂ and (GT)₁₂ oligonucleotides end-labelled with [γ^{32} P] dATP (T4 Polynucleotide kinase RTG kit; Pharmacia) and washed at 52 °C with a 3M tetramethylammonium chloride buffer.

I produced minipreps (Sambrook *et al.* 1989) for 133 positive clones, amplified the inserts with M13 forward and reverse primers and sequenced them on a 3100 Genetic Analyser (Applied Biosystems) using BigDye™ Terminator cycle sequencing system version 3.1 (Applied Biosystems). Of the 133 sequenced inserts, 96 of 109 (88%) with good sequence contained a microsatellite repeat and of those, 67 (62%) contained unique microsatellite repeats. I designed primers for 47 of the 67 unique microsatellite-containing sequences using PrimerSelect (DNAStar) and

Correspondence: D. R. Rubenstein, Fax: 1-607-254-4308; E-mail: drr24@cornell.edu

ultimately developed 45 microsatellite loci for the superb starling. Forward primers were labelled using the fluorescent dyes 6-FAMTM, NEDTM, PETTM and VICTM (Applied Biosystems). To test for variability, I screened 17–32 adult individuals (mean 31) chosen randomly from a population of > 400 individuals from 10 social groups (Table 1). Each 10 µL PCR contained: 0.5–1 U JumpStartTM *Taq* DNA polymerase (Sigma), 0.2 mM dNTPs (Invitrogen), 10 mM Tris-HCl (pH 8.3), 50 mM KCl, 1–3 mM MgCl₂, 0.15 µM of forward and reverse primers and 1–50 ng of genomic DNA. PCRs consisted of 35 cycles at 94 °C for 50 s, *T_a* for 1 min, 72 °C for 1 min and a final extension at 72 °C for 4 min 30 s. I also tested six markers – four of which were polymorphic in the European starling (Loyau *et al.* 2005) – developed for other passerine species using the same methods (Appendix 1).

Genotyping was performed on a 3100 Genetic Analyser (Applied Biosystems) and fragment sizes were scored using GENEMAPPERTM 3.0 software (Applied Biosystems). Of the 45 superb starling loci screened, 31 (69%) were polymorphic and had between two and 16 alleles (mean 4.6) (Table 1). Observed heterozygosities (*H_O*) ranged from 0.03 to 0.88, whereas expected (*H_E*) heterozygosities ranged from 0.03 to 0.90 (Table 1) (cERVUS 2.0; Marshall *et al.* 1998). I did not conduct tests of Hardy–Weinberg equilibrium because individuals were sampled from multiple small social groups with a high likelihood of inbreeding. None of the markers showed strong evidence of linkage disequilibrium (all *P* > 0.001 after sequential Bonferroni correction) (GENEPOP 3.4; Raymond & Rousset 1995). I tested all 31 markers for cross-species amplification on other species of Sturnidae, as well as species in the sister taxa Mimidae and other species of Passerines, and found that 28 (90%) of the markers amplified product for at least one species (Table 2). Since these 31 markers had a mean expected heterozygosity of 0.42 and yielded a combined parental exclusionary power of 0.99998, they will be useful for examining family relationships and the social structure of the plural cooperatively breeding superb starling.

Acknowledgements

This work was conducted in the Evolutionary Genetics Core Facility at Cornell University and the Evolutionary Biology Laboratory at the Cornell Laboratory of Ornithology. S. Bogdanowicz, I. Lovette and L. Stenzler provided invaluable guidance with microsatellite development and genotyping. My research on superb starlings was funded by a Howard Hughes Medical Institute Predoctoral Fellowship in Biological Sciences, a National Science Foundation Doctoral Dissertation Improvement Grant (IBN-407713) and a Smithsonian Tropical Research Institute Predoctoral Fellowship, as well as grants from the Animal Behaviour Society, the Wilson Ornithological Society, the Society of Integrative and Comparative Biology, the American Ornithologists' Union, the American Museum of Natural History, the Andrew W. Mellon Foundation, the Harvard Travellers Club, the Cornell Laboratory

Table 1 Characterization of 31 polymorphic microsatellite loci from the superb starling (*Lamprotornis superbus*). Recommended annealing temperatures (*T_a*), MgCl₂ concentrations and amounts of *Taq* are listed for each locus. The product size range and number of alleles for each locus are given for sample sizes of *N* individuals. Observed (*H_O*) and expected (*H_E*) heterozygosities were calculated using the program cERVUS 2.0 (Marshall *et al.* 1998)

Locus	GenBank Accession no.	Repeat motif	Primer sequence (5'-3')	<i>T_a</i> (°C)	MgCl ₂ (mM)	<i>Taq</i> (U)	Product size range (bp)	No. of alleles	<i>H_O</i>	<i>H_E</i>
SS1-6	AY906875	(CA) ₁₅	F: TTTCACAGGCTGGATCTGGTAAACC R: CTAGCAACATATACTCCAAAGCTATTGATCAT	60	2.0	0.5	196–212	8	32	0.88
SS2-10	AY906876	(GT) ₁₀ (CTGT) ₄ (GT) ₅ CAC(TGT) ₄ CT(GT) ₅ CAGTAT(GT) ₅ GGGTCT(GT) ₂	F: ATTCAGAAAGGGATGTTGAGCTGAGTG R: CTCAGAACAGGATTCCTCAAGAACAC	59	1.0	1.0	314–513	14	32	0.44
SS1-11	AY906870	GGGTCTACTT(GT) ₂ CT(GT) ₂ (CT) ₂ (GT) ₅ CT(GT) ₆ CT(GT) ₆ (CTGT) ₂ (GT) ₄	F: AAATTGAAACCGATCCACGCCCTGTTTA R: CTCGTTCCCTCTCCCTCTTCAC	61	2.0	1.0	180–192	8	31	0.52
SS1-12	AY906871	(AC) ₁₁	F: TATTTTCCTCTTCTCCCTCCCTTCAC R: GAAGCCAACAATATGTCAGAAATCTGC	60	2.0	1.0	207–213	4	31	0.13
SS1-15	AY906872	(GA) ₈ (GT) ₁₀	F: ATCCCCCTTGTGATTCATCTGCTGTT R: CACCGGACTCTGTGGCAAGTAG	58	2.0	0.5	308–316	4	31	0.48
SS2-16	AY906886	(AT) ₂ (GT) ₁₁	F: CTGTATTCGCCACCTTCCCTGTGTT R: TTAGCTGGTTCTGAGGTTATGT	62	2.0	0.5	196–198	2	31	0.16
SS2-28	AY906887	(AC) ₆ AT(AC) ₅	F: AGACCGCTACCTTCTTCCTTC R: TCTCACAAATTAGAATATTTAATTTAAAAA	58	2.5	1.0	168–170	2	30	0.07
SS2-29	AY906888	(TA) ₂ TG(TA) ₄ TG(CA) ₄ CT(CA) ₄	F: AAAATAAAGCAGAAATCAGATAAAAGTC R: TCTGTTTGTGTTCTCATAAAAATTAAACA	58	2.5	1.0	171–173	2	30	0.03

Table 1 *Continued*

Locus	GenBank Accession no.	Repeat motif	Primer sequence (5'-3')	T _a (°C)	MgCl ₂ (mM)	Taq (U)	Product size range (bp)	No. of alleles	N	H _O	H _E
SS2-32	AY906889	(TG) ₁₃	F: GGTATCACCATATCTGCTGCCAGTA R: CAGGTTTGCTGACAATTATTTG	58	2.0	0.5	246–252	4	31	0.36	0.34
SS2-40	AY906892	(CA) ₁₁	F: AACACTAAAGCACTGTTAACAC R: GATTCTGGAGTTCTAATCTGAGAA	62	2.0	1.0	180–184	2	31	0.29	0.25
SS3-42C	AY906917	(CA) ₂ TACG(CA) ₂₀ CTCG(TG) ₂	F: TATATCCCAGGGGGTTGTGGTGTG R: ATCAAACCTGAGCAGGACTCTGACTGTG	60	2.0	0.5	150–184	16	32	0.84	0.90
SS2-45	AY906894	(AC) ₉ AACT(AC) ₅ TC(TA) ₂ (TG) ₂	F: CAGTGATGAACGCCCTCTATAACAGCT R: GTAGGCACCATTTGAATGCTGAGTGAC	58	2.0	0.5	263–269	3	30	0.20	0.57
SS2-46	AY906895	(CA) ₉ TG(CA) ₂	F: TTATGGTAAACTTCTGTACACTGG R: ATTCCAACTCTAAACACTCTGAGGTT	62	2.0	1.0	183–189	3	31	0.23	0.26
SS2-49	AY906896	(AC) ₈	F: TGCCACTCATTCAATCCA R: ACACCTCAGTTAACAGCTATCTTGGTG	60	2.0	0.5	114–118	3	31	0.45	0.50
SS2-52	AY906898	(CA) ₅ TA(CA) ₄ (TA) ₂ CAAA(CA) ₃	F: CTTCGGGGCATGCAATAGATGAG R: CATTGAGCTGGCACTGGAAATCAA	60	2.0	0.5	356–358	3	31	0.16	0.26
SS2-53	AY906899	(TA) ₃ (TG) ₆	F: ACAAAATAATTCTCATTTCTCAGAG R: ACACCTCTAAAAATCACAACACTGAAA	56	2.5	0.5	163–167	2	30	0.03	0.03
SS2-56	AY906901	(TC) ₅ TG(TC) ₅	F: AACACAAAGCTCACGCTGGTACA R: TGAAACACTCAGCTGGTCTCAA	60	2.5	0.5	82–83	2	32	0.03	0.03
SS2-68	AY906905	(GT) ₆ AT(GT) ₇	F: AACTTGCTGGTTGAAAATTAAATG R: TGTTCTTAATTGTTACTCAGAAGTGAA	60	2.0	1.0	142–148	4	31	0.52	0.54
SS2-71B	AY906906	(TG) ₁₈	F: CACACCAACATGTAACAAATCTTACA R: CTTTGAGGCTCTGTTTAGAAATTG	62	2.0	0.5	332–338	5	31	0.74	0.67
SS2-76	AY906908	(TG) ₇ TC(TG) ₂	F: TCCTCTTGACTGCCTCTATTCTTCTGT R: AGCATGGCAGTCACCTTTCTCC	60	2.0	0.5	154–171	6	32	0.22	0.24
SS2-78	AY906909	(AG) ₁₀	F: TGAACCTTCTTAGCCTTATATCACAACA R: ATTACCCAATGAGCTACTGCTCTGCTT	58	2.0	1.0	277–281	3	30	0.77	0.49
SS2-80	AY906910	(CA) ₈ AAA(CA) ₃ TA(CA) ₂	F: ACCACCTTTACCTACCTAGCATGTTCTGT R: ATTAGAGTGGCCAAGGACTTGTCTCTCA	58	2.0	0.5	320–326	4	31	0.19	0.29
SS2-82	AY906911	(AC) ₃ AA(AC) ₅ AT(AC) ₃	F: CTGGGCAACCCCTAACATTTCTG R: GGTGCATGAAAAATATGGGTCAAATAC	60	2.0	0.5	285–289	2	28	0.32	0.43
SS2-83	AY906912	(AC) ₁₃	F: TGTCCCAGTTTACATTTTGTTAA R: GACTTTTAATATGGAGCCTGCTCT	58	2.0	1.0	162–176	7	32	0.72	0.73
SS2-88	AY906913	(CT) ₂ (GT) ₆	F: GTCTAGAGTAGTTAAACCCATATACTT R: AACAGCTAACACCCCCACCTC	52	1.5	1.0	101–105	2	32	0.34	0.40
SS2-106	AY906877	(GT) ₉	F: TGTCTTATCCCATTGTAAGGGCTCTT R: GACTCTAGGTGAAACCCCATTTT	56	3.0	1.0	292–301	5	32	0.25	0.36
SS2-114	AY906878	(GT) ₁₆ (AT) ₂ (GTAT) ₂ (GT) ₃	F: TGAGGCCTGCTTCAGATTTTCAT R: CCATATTGAGTATTGGGACATGTGAGTTAT	60	2.0	1.0	410–414	3	31	0.13	0.15
SS2-119*	AY906879	(TG) ₄ CA(TG) ₁₂	F: CGGTTAACATGCAATGCCACCTTTG R: GCCCTGTCCCAACCCCTCAT	61	2.0	0.5	273–275	2	30	0.30	0.46
SS2-121	AY906880	(AT) ₂ GTCT(AT) ₅ (AC) ₇	F: AGGTGCACAAGTTCTGCTCCAGTAT R: AACTTCCCTTCAACCCGCTATCC	61	2.0	1.0	167–172	6	32	0.78	0.79
SS2-130	AY906884	(CT) ₃ C(CA) ₇ CCAGTGAG(CA) ₂ TG(CA) ₅	F: CTGAAGGCACCCAGCAGGTTCT R: AGACCCACTGTGATAATTACCACTCTCTG	58	2.0	0.5	261–267	4	30	0.50	0.61
SS2-132	AY906885	(AC) ₆ CC(AC) ₈ AA(TC) ₈	F: TATATTGACACCCCTCGCTGGAATCC R: TTTCGTAAGGTGGCAAACCTCTGTGT	60	1.5	1.0	224–252	6	32	0.38	0.36

*high flanking sequence similarity with microsatellite sequence from the mallard (*Anas platyrhynchos*) (GenBank Accession no. AY493257).

Table 2 Cross-species amplification of 31 polymorphic superb starling microsatellite markers. I tested one individual of each species for each microsatellite marker and visualized them on a 2% agarose gel. Markers that did not amplify are indicated by (–), whereas markers that amplified brightly are indicated by (+) and those that only weakly amplified are indicated by (W)

Sturnidae				Mimidae		Other species		
Locus	European starling (<i>Sturnus vulgaris</i>)	Spotless starling (<i>Sturnus unicolor</i>)	Common myna (<i>Acridotheres tristis</i>)	Northern mockingbird (<i>Mimus polyglottos</i>)	Tropical mockingbird (<i>Mimus gilvus</i>)	House finch (<i>Carpodacus mexicanus</i>)	Banded wren (<i>Thryothorus pleurostictus</i>)	Bicknell's thrush (<i>Catharus bicknelli</i>)
SS1-6	+	+	+	+	+	+	–	+
SS2-10	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
SS1-11	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+
SS1-12	+	+	–	+	+	+	+	+
SS1-15	–	–	–	+	+	–	–	–
SS2-16	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+
SS2-28	–	–	W	–	–	–	–	–
SS2-29	+	+	+	+	+	–	–	–
SS2-32	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+
SS2-40	+	+	+	+	+	–	–	–
SS3-42C	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+
SS2-45	+	+	+	–	–	–	–	–
SS2-46	+	+	+	–	–	–	–	–
SS2-49	–	–	W	+	+	–	–	–
SS2-52	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+
SS2-53	–	–	+	+†	+	–	–	+*
SS2-56	+	+	+	+	+	+	–	+
SS2-63	+	+	–	+	+	–	–	+
SS2-68	+	+	–	+	+	+	–	+
SS2-71B	+	+	+	–	–	–	W	–
SS2-76	W	W	W	W	W	–	–	–
SS2-78	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
SS2-80	+	+	+	+	+	–	+	+
SS2-82	–	–	–	+	+	+	–	+
SS2-83	+	+	+	+	+	+	–	+
SS2-106	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+
SS2-114	+	+	+	+	+	–	–	+
SS2-119	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+
SS2-121	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
SS2-130	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+
SS2-132	–	–	–	W	–	–	–	–

*bands of an unexpected size; †double bands.

of Ornithology, Cornell Sigma Xi, the Cornell University Mario Einaudi Center for International Studies, the Cornell University Department of Neurobiology and Behaviour and the Cornell University Graduate School.

References

- Dawson DA, Hanotte O, Greig C, Stewart IRK, Burke T (2000) Polymorphic microsatellites in the blue tit *Parus caeruleus* and their cross-species utility in 20 songbird families. *Molecular Ecology*, **9**, 1941–1943.
- Fry CH, Keith S, Urban EK (2000) *The Birds of Africa*. Academic Press, San Diego.
- Hamilton MB, Pincus EL, Di Fiore A, Fleischer RC (1999) Universal linker and ligation procedures for construction of genomic DNA libraries enriched for microsatellites. *BioTechniques*, **27**, 500–507.
- Hughes CR, Deloach DM (1997) Developing microsatellites when they are rare: trinucleotide repeat loci in the northern mockingbird *Mimus polyglottos*. *Molecular Ecology*, **6**, 1099–1102.
- Kijas JMH, Fowler JCS, Garbett CA, Thomas MR (1994) Enrichment of microsatellites from the citrus genome using biotinylated oligonucleotide sequences bound to streptavidin-coated magnetic particles. *BioTechniques*, **16**, 656.
- Li S-H, Huang Y-J, Brown JL (1997) Isolation of tetranucleotide microsatellites from the Mexican jay *Aphelocoma ultramarina*. *Molecular Ecology*, **6**, 499–501.
- Loyau A, Moureau B, Richard M, Christe P, Heeb P, Sorci G (2005) Cross-amplification of polymorphic microsatellites reveals extra-pair paternity and brood parasitism in *Sturnus vulgaris*. *Molecular Ecology Notes*, **5**, 135–139.
- Marshall TC, Slate J, Kruuk LEB, Pemberton JM (1998) Statistical confidence for likelihood-based paternity inference in natural populations. *Molecular Ecology*, **7**, 639–655.
- Primmer CR, Møller AP, Ellegren H (1996) New microsatellites from the pied flycatcher *Ficedula hypoleuca* and the swallow *Hirundo rustica* genomes. *Hereditas*, **124**, 281–283.
- Raymond M, Rousset F (1995) GENEPOL (version 1.2): population genetics software for exact tests and ecumenicism. *Journal of Heredity*, **6**, 248–249.
- Richardson DS, Jury FL, Dawson DA, Salgueiro P, Komdeur J, Burke T (2000) Fifty Seychelles warbler (*Acrocephalus sechellensis*) microsatellite loci polymorphic in Sylviidae species and their cross-species amplification in other passerine birds. *Molecular Ecology*, **9**, 2226–2231.
- Sambrook J, Fritsch EF, Maniatis T (1989) *Molecular Cloning: A Laboratory Manual*, 2nd edn. Cold Spring Harbor Laboratory Press, New York.
- Seutin G, White BN, Boag PT (1991) Preservation of avian blood and tissue samples for DNA analysis. *Canadian Journal of Zoology*, **69**, 82–90.

Appendix 1 Six microsatellites developed for other species cross-amplified on the superb starling (*Lamprotornis superbus*) and were polymorphic. Recommended annealing temperatures (T_a), MgCl₂ concentrations and amounts of *Taq* are listed for each locus. The product size range and number of alleles for each locus are given for sample sizes of N individuals. Observed (H_O) and expected (H_E) heterozygosities were calculated using the program CERVUS 2.0 (Marshall *et al.* 1998)

Locus	Initial species	Citation	Repeat motif	Primer sequence (5'-3')	T_a (°C)	MgCl ₂ (mM)	<i>Taq</i> (U)	Product size range (bp)	No. of alleles	N	H_O	H_E
Ase18	Seychelles warbler (<i>Acrocephalus sechellensis</i>)	Richardson <i>et al.</i> (2000)	(GT) ₁₂	F: ATCCAGTCTTCGCAAAAGCC R: TGCCCCAGAGGAAGAAG	51	1.5	0.5	187–189	2	28	0.29	0.25
FhU3	Pied flycatcher (<i>Ficedula hypoleuca</i>)	Primmer <i>et al.</i> (1996)	(GT) ₈ A(TG) ₁₂	F: ATATTCCCCATAAGATAATGG R: ATAGTGTGCTTAAGGTCTCT	48	3.0	0.5	172–176	5*	29	1.00	0.74
Mjg1	Mexican jay (<i>Aphelocoma ultramarina</i>)	Li <i>et al.</i> (1997)	(AAAG) _{>20}	F: CCCGGAAAGGCCTCGTCTTC R: GGAGATTTTATATCGGTGGC	58	2.5	0.5	146–153	8*	29	0.76	0.76
MpAAT 24	Northern mockingbird (<i>Mimus polyglottos</i>)	Hughes & Deloach (1997)	(AAT) ₆ ... (AAT) ₆	F: CATGGACAGGCAGGATAGAC R: TGGCAGAGAGGAACAAAGATA	55	2.0	0.5	121–133	3	30	0.40	0.51
MpAAT 25	Northern mockingbird (<i>Mimus polyglottos</i>)	Hughes & Deloach (1997)	(AAT) ₉	F: ACCAAATTCCCCACAGAGAC R: GCTGGGAGCACTGGTGT	55	2.0	0.5	94–98	2	20	0.25	0.22
Pca7	Blue tit (<i>Parus caeruleus</i>)	Dawson <i>et al.</i> (2000)	(TG) ₂₄	F: TGACCATCGTAGGCCAGCAG R: GGTCAGGACACCTGACAATG	57	2.0	0.5	90–94	2	29	0.00	0.07

*confidence in marker is low since alleles show many stutter bands and are only separated by one bp.