## Algorithms for Extremal Queues in $\mathrm{Gl} / \mathrm{Gl} / 1$

Yan Chen

Columbia University, IEOR Department
Joint work with Ward Whitt
Columbia University, IEOR Department

## Motivation

- Extremal queues in $G I / G I / 1: F_{0} / G_{u} / 1$ (Chen and Whitt (2018)) (a special two-point inter-arrival and service times queue)


## Motivation

- Extremal queues in $G I / G I / 1: F_{0} / G_{u} / 1$ (Chen and Whitt (2018)) (a special two-point inter-arrival and service times queue)
- Research Question: How to obtain the steady-state mean waiting time $E\left[W\left(F_{0} / G_{u} / 1\right)\right]$ (tight upper bound) ?


## Motivation

- Extremal queues in $G I / G I / 1: F_{0} / G_{u} / 1$ (Chen and Whitt (2018)) (a special two-point inter-arrival and service times queue)
- Research Question: How to obtain the steady-state mean waiting time $E\left[W\left(F_{0} / G_{u} / 1\right)\right]$ (tight upper bound) ?
- GOAL: closed form solution of $E\left[W\left(F_{0} / G_{u} / 1\right)\right]$ ?


## Motivation

- Extremal queues in $G I / G I / 1: F_{0} / G_{u} / 1$ (Chen and Whitt (2018)) (a special two-point inter-arrival and service times queue)
- Research Question: How to obtain the steady-state mean waiting time $E\left[W\left(F_{0} / G_{u} / 1\right)\right]$ (tight upper bound) ?
- GOAL: closed form solution of $E\left[W\left(F_{0} / G_{u} / 1\right)\right]$ ?
- GOAL: effective algoritms to estimate $E\left[W\left(F_{0} / G_{u} / 1\right)\right]$ ?


## Basic Settings

- Steady-state Waiting Time $\left(W_{0}=0\right)$ :

$$
\begin{gathered}
W \stackrel{\mathrm{~d}}{=}[W+V-U]^{+} \\
w: \mathcal{P}_{a, 2}\left(M_{a}\right) \times \mathcal{P}_{s, 2}\left(M_{s}\right) \rightarrow \mathbb{R}, w(F, G) \equiv E[W(F, G)]
\end{gathered}
$$

where $0<\rho<1$ and

- Mean Waiting Time:

$$
\begin{array}{r}
E[W]=\sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \frac{E\left[S_{k}^{+}\right]}{k}<\infty . \\
S_{k} \equiv X_{1}+\cdots+X_{k} \text { and } X_{k} \equiv V_{k}-U_{k}, k \geq 1 .
\end{array}
$$

## Background

$\left(1, c_{a}^{2}+1\right)$ for interarrival $F$ and $\left(\rho, \rho^{2}\left(c_{s}^{2}+1\right)\right)$ for service $G$.

- Kingman (1962) bound:

$$
E[W(F, G)] \leq \frac{\rho^{2}\left(\left[c_{a}^{2} / \rho^{2}\right]+c_{s}^{2}\right)}{2(1-\rho)} .
$$

## Background

$\left(1, c_{a}^{2}+1\right)$ for interarrival $F$ and $\left(\rho, \rho^{2}\left(c_{s}^{2}+1\right)\right)$ for service $G$.

- Kingman (1962) bound:

$$
E[W(F, G)] \leq \frac{\rho^{2}\left(\left[c_{a}^{2} / \rho^{2}\right]+c_{s}^{2}\right)}{2(1-\rho)} .
$$

- Daley (1977) bound:

$$
E[W(F, G)] \leq \frac{\rho^{2}\left(\left[(2-\rho) c_{a}^{2} / \rho\right]+c_{s}^{2}\right)}{2(1-\rho)}
$$

## Background

$\left(1, c_{a}^{2}+1\right)$ for interarrival $F$ and $\left(\rho, \rho^{2}\left(c_{s}^{2}+1\right)\right)$ for service $G$.

- Kingman (1962) bound:

$$
E[W(F, G)] \leq \frac{\rho^{2}\left(\left[c_{a}^{2} / \rho^{2}\right]+c_{s}^{2}\right)}{2(1-\rho)} .
$$

- Daley (1977) bound:

$$
E[W(F, G)] \leq \frac{\rho^{2}\left(\left[(2-\rho) c_{a}^{2} / \rho\right]+c_{s}^{2}\right)}{2(1-\rho)}
$$

- Heavy Traffic Approximation:

$$
E[W(M, G)]=\frac{\rho^{2}\left(1+c_{s}^{2}\right)}{2(1-\rho)} .
$$

## Background

$\left(1, c_{a}^{2}+1\right)$ for interarrival $F$ and $\left(\rho, \rho^{2}\left(c_{s}^{2}+1\right)\right)$ for service $G$.

- Kingman (1962) bound:

$$
E[W(F, G)] \leq \frac{\rho^{2}\left(\left[c_{a}^{2} / \rho^{2}\right]+c_{s}^{2}\right)}{2(1-\rho)} .
$$

- Daley (1977) bound:

$$
E[W(F, G)] \leq \frac{\rho^{2}\left(\left[(2-\rho) c_{a}^{2} / \rho\right]+c_{s}^{2}\right)}{2(1-\rho)}
$$

- Heavy Traffic Approximation:

$$
E[W(M, G)]=\frac{\rho^{2}\left(1+c_{s}^{2}\right)}{2(1-\rho)} .
$$

- Ott (1987) bound:

$$
E\left[W\left(D, A_{3}\right)\right]=\frac{\rho\left(\left(1+c_{s}^{2}\right) \rho-1\right)^{+}}{2(1-\rho)}
$$

## Extremal Distributions

Two-point cdfs under $\left(1,1+c_{a}^{2}\right)$ and $\left(\rho, \rho^{2}\left(1+c_{s}^{2}\right)\right)$ :

## Extremal Distributions

Two-point cdfs under $\left(1,1+c_{a}^{2}\right)$ and $\left(\rho, \rho^{2}\left(1+c_{s}^{2}\right)\right)$ :

- $F: c_{a}^{2} /\left(c_{a}^{2}+\left(b_{a}-1\right)^{2}\right)$ at $b_{a},\left(b_{a}-1\right)^{2} /\left(c_{a}^{2}+\left(b_{a}-1\right)^{2}\right)$ at $1-c_{a}^{2} /\left(b_{a}-1\right)$ where $1+c_{a}^{2} \leq b_{a} \leq M_{a}$.


## Extremal Distributions

Two-point cdfs under $\left(1,1+c_{a}^{2}\right)$ and $\left(\rho, \rho^{2}\left(1+c_{s}^{2}\right)\right)$ :

- $F: c_{a}^{2} /\left(c_{a}^{2}+\left(b_{a}-1\right)^{2}\right)$ at $b_{a},\left(b_{a}-1\right)^{2} /\left(c_{a}^{2}+\left(b_{a}-1\right)^{2}\right)$ at $1-c_{a}^{2} /\left(b_{a}-1\right)$ where $1+c_{a}^{2} \leq b_{a} \leq M_{a}$.
- $G: c_{s}^{2} /\left(c_{s}^{2}+\left(b_{s}-1\right)^{2}\right)$ at $\rho b_{s},\left(b_{s}-1\right)^{2} /\left(c_{s}^{2}+\left(b_{s}-1\right)^{2}\right)$ at $\rho\left(1-c_{s}^{2} /\left(b_{s}-1\right)\right)$ where $1+c_{s}^{2} \leq b_{s} \leq M_{s}$.


## Extremal Distributions

Two-point cdfs under $\left(1,1+c_{a}^{2}\right)$ and $\left(\rho, \rho^{2}\left(1+c_{s}^{2}\right)\right)$ :

- $F: c_{a}^{2} /\left(c_{a}^{2}+\left(b_{a}-1\right)^{2}\right)$ at $b_{a},\left(b_{a}-1\right)^{2} /\left(c_{a}^{2}+\left(b_{a}-1\right)^{2}\right)$ at $1-c_{a}^{2} /\left(b_{a}-1\right)$ where $1+c_{a}^{2} \leq b_{a} \leq M_{a}$.
- G: $c_{s}^{2} /\left(c_{s}^{2}+\left(b_{s}-1\right)^{2}\right)$ at $\rho b_{s},\left(b_{s}-1\right)^{2} /\left(c_{s}^{2}+\left(b_{s}-1\right)^{2}\right)$ at $\rho\left(1-c_{s}^{2} /\left(b_{s}-1\right)\right)$ where $1+c_{s}^{2} \leq b_{s} \leq M_{s}$.
- $F=F_{0}$ for $b_{a}=1+c_{a}^{2}$ and $F=F_{u}$ when $b_{a}=M_{a}$.


## Extremal Distributions

Two-point cdfs under $\left(1,1+c_{a}^{2}\right)$ and $\left(\rho, \rho^{2}\left(1+c_{s}^{2}\right)\right)$ :

- $F: c_{a}^{2} /\left(c_{a}^{2}+\left(b_{a}-1\right)^{2}\right)$ at $b_{a},\left(b_{a}-1\right)^{2} /\left(c_{a}^{2}+\left(b_{a}-1\right)^{2}\right)$ at $1-c_{a}^{2} /\left(b_{a}-1\right)$ where $1+c_{a}^{2} \leq b_{a} \leq M_{a}$.
- $G: c_{s}^{2} /\left(c_{s}^{2}+\left(b_{s}-1\right)^{2}\right)$ at $\rho b_{s},\left(b_{s}-1\right)^{2} /\left(c_{s}^{2}+\left(b_{s}-1\right)^{2}\right)$ at $\rho\left(1-c_{s}^{2} /\left(b_{s}-1\right)\right)$ where $1+c_{s}^{2} \leq b_{s} \leq M_{s}$.
- $F=F_{0}$ for $b_{a}=1+c_{a}^{2}$ and $F=F_{u}$ when $b_{a}=M_{a}$.
- $G=G_{0}$ for $b_{s}=1+c_{s}^{2}$ and $G=G_{u}$ when $b_{s}=M_{s}$.


## Reduction

- Three-point reduction:

$$
\sup _{\left.M_{a}\right), G \in \mathcal{P}_{s, 2}\left(M_{s}\right)} E[W(F, G)]=E\left[W\left(F^{*}, G^{*}\right)\right]
$$

where $F^{*} \in \mathcal{P}_{a, 2,3}\left(M_{a}\right), G^{*} \in \mathcal{P}_{s, 2,3}\left(M_{s}\right)$.

## Reduction

- Three-point reduction:

$$
\sup E[W(F, G)]=E\left[W\left(F^{*}, G^{*}\right)\right]
$$

where $F^{*} \in \mathcal{P}_{a, 2,3}\left(M_{a}\right), G^{*} \in \mathcal{P}_{s, 2,3}\left(M_{s}\right)$.

- Two-point reduction:

$$
\sup _{F \in \mathcal{P}_{a, 2,3}\left(M_{a}\right), G \in \mathcal{P}_{s, 2,3}\left(M_{s}\right)} E[W(F, G)]=E\left[W\left(F_{0}, G_{u}\right)\right] .
$$

## Reduction

- Three-point reduction:

$$
\sup _{F \in \mathcal{P}_{a, 2}\left(M_{a}\right), G \in \mathcal{P}_{s, 2}\left(M_{s}\right)} E[W(F, G)]=E\left[W\left(F^{*}, G^{*}\right)\right]
$$

where $F^{*} \in \mathcal{P}_{a, 2,3}\left(M_{a}\right), G^{*} \in \mathcal{P}_{s, 2,3}\left(M_{s}\right)$.

- Two-point reduction:

$$
\sup _{F \in \mathcal{P}_{a, 2,3}\left(M_{a}\right), G \in \mathcal{P}_{s, 2,3}\left(M_{s}\right)} E[W(F, G)]=E\left[W\left(F_{0}, G_{u}\right)\right]
$$

Research Question: define $E\left[W\left(F_{0}, G_{u^{*}}\right)\right] \equiv \lim _{M_{s} \rightarrow \infty} E\left[W\left(F_{0}, G_{u}\right)\right]$, how to evaluate $E\left[W\left(F_{0}, G_{u^{*}}\right)\right]$ ?

## Reduction for Interarrival Time

## Theorem

For any service-time $V$ with $c d f G$ having mean $\rho$ and $s C v c_{s}^{2}$, the steady-state waiting time is distributed as (denoted by $\stackrel{\text { d }}{=}$ )

$$
W\left(F_{0} / G / 1\right) \stackrel{\mathrm{d}}{=} W(D(1 / p) / R S(V, p) / 1)+\sum_{k=1}^{N(p)-1} V_{k}
$$

for $N(p)$ and $R S(V, p)$. Hence, the mean is

$$
\begin{aligned}
E\left[W\left(F_{0} / G / 1\right)\right] & =E[W(D(1 / p) / R S(V, p) / 1)]+(E[N(p)]-1) E[V] \\
& =E[W(D(1 / p) / R S(V, p) / 1)]+\rho(1-p) / p \\
& =E[W(D(1 / p) / R S(V, p) / 1)]+\rho c_{a}^{2} .
\end{aligned}
$$

## Reduction for Service Time

Theorem
(the Daley decomposition) Consider the $F / G_{u} / 1$ model with arbitrary interarrival-time cdf $F$ and two-point service-time $c d f G_{u}$. Then

$$
\begin{aligned}
\lim _{M_{s} \rightarrow \infty} E\left[W\left(F / G_{u} / 1\right)\right] & =E[W(F / D(\rho) / 1)]+\lim _{M_{s} \rightarrow \infty} E\left[W\left(D(1) / G_{u} / 1\right)\right] . \\
& =E[W(F / D(\rho) / 1)]+\frac{\rho^{2} c_{s}^{2}}{2(1-\rho)} .
\end{aligned}
$$

## Overall Reduction

## Theorem

(overall decomposition of the upper bound) For the GI/GI/1 model with extremal interarrival-time cdf $F_{0}$ and extremal service-time $c d f G_{u^{*}}$,

$$
E\left[W\left(F_{0}, G_{u^{*}}\right)\right] \equiv \lim _{M_{s} \rightarrow \infty} E\left[W\left(F_{0} / G_{u} / 1\right)\right]
$$

$$
=E[W(D(1 / p) / R S(D(\rho), p) / 1)]+\rho c_{a}^{2}+\frac{\rho^{2} c_{s}^{2}}{2(1-\rho)}
$$

for $p \equiv 1 /\left(c_{a}^{2}+1\right)$.

## Numerical Algorithm

A new service time:

$$
\begin{equation*}
R S(V, p) \stackrel{\mathrm{d}}{=} \sum_{k=1}^{N(p)} V_{k} \tag{1}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $N(p)$ is a geometric random variable on the positive integers, having mean $E[N(p)]=1 / p$ with $p=1 /\left(1+c_{a}^{2}\right)$ and $\left\{V_{k}: k \geq 1\right\}$ is i.i.d. random variables distributed as a service time $V$.

## Numerical Algorithm

A new service time:

$$
\begin{equation*}
R S(V, p) \stackrel{\mathrm{d}}{=} \sum_{k=1}^{N(p)} V_{k} \tag{1}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $N(p)$ is a geometric random variable on the positive integers, having mean $E[N(p)]=1 / p$ with $p=1 /\left(1+c_{a}^{2}\right)$ and $\left\{V_{k}: k \geq 1\right\}$ is i.i.d. random variables distributed as a service time $V$.

- Apply Inter-arrival Time Reduction:

$$
E\left[W\left(F_{0}, G\right)\right]=E[W(D(1 / p), R S(V, p))]+\rho c_{a}^{2} .
$$

## Numerical Algorithm

A new service time:

$$
\begin{equation*}
R S(V, p) \stackrel{\mathrm{d}}{=} \sum_{k=1}^{N(p)} V_{k} \tag{1}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $N(p)$ is a geometric random variable on the positive integers, having mean $E[N(p)]=1 / p$ with $p=1 /\left(1+c_{a}^{2}\right)$ and $\left\{V_{k}: k \geq 1\right\}$ is i.i.d. random variables distributed as a service time $V$.

- Apply Inter-arrival Time Reduction:

$$
E\left[W\left(F_{0}, G\right)\right]=E[W(D(1 / p), R S(V, p))]+\rho c_{a}^{2} .
$$

- Apply Daley Decomposition:

$$
E\left[W\left(F_{0}, G_{u^{*}}\right)\right]=E[W(D(1 / p), R S(D(\rho), p))]+\text { const. }
$$

## Numerical Algorithm (Negative Binomial)

## Lemma

(NB representation) For the $D(1 / p) / R S(D(\rho), p) / 1$ model,

$$
S_{k} \stackrel{\mathrm{~d}}{=} \rho(N B(n, 1-p)+n)-(n / p),
$$

so that

$$
E[W]=\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{E\left[(\rho(N B(n, 1-p)+n)-(n / p))^{+}\right]}{n} .
$$

## Numerical Algorithm (Negative Binomial)

## Lemma

(NB representation) For the $D(1 / p) / R S(D(\rho), p) / 1$ model,

$$
S_{k} \stackrel{\mathrm{~d}}{=} \rho(N B(n, 1-p)+n)-(n / p),
$$

so that

$$
E[W]=\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{E\left[(\rho(N B(n, 1-p)+n)-(n / p))^{+}\right]}{n} .
$$

pmf: $P(N B(n, 1-p)=k) \equiv\left(\frac{(n+k-1)!}{k!(n-1)!}\right) p^{n}(1-p)^{k}$.

## Numerical Algorithm (Negative Binomial)

## Lemma

(NB representation) For the $D(1 / p) / R S(D(\rho), p) / 1$ model,

$$
S_{k} \stackrel{\mathrm{~d}}{=} \rho(N B(n, 1-p)+n)-(n / p),
$$

so that

$$
E[W]=\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{E\left[(\rho(N B(n, 1-p)+n)-(n / p))^{+}\right]}{n} .
$$

pmf: $P(N B(n, 1-p)=k) \equiv\left(\frac{(n+k-1)!}{k!(n-1)!}\right) p^{n}(1-p)^{k}$.
recursion: $\mathbb{P}(N B=k)=\mathbb{P}(N B=k-1)(n+k-1) / k)(1-p)$.

## Numerical Algorithm (Negative Binomial)

```
Algorithm 1 Basic Negative Binomial Recursion ( \(k\) in outer loop)
    1: for \(k \in[K]\) do
    2: \(\quad S(k) \leftarrow 0, n b p d f \leftarrow p(1-p)^{k}\)
    3: \(\quad\) for \(n \in[n]\) do
    4: \(\quad S(k) \leftarrow S(k)+n b p d f \max ((n+k) \rho-n / p, 0) / n\)
    5: \(\quad n b p d f \leftarrow n b p d f\left(\frac{n+k}{n}\right) p\)
    6: \(\quad E[W] \leftarrow E[W]+S(k)\)
    7: Output \(E[W]\)
```


## Numerical Algorithm (Negative Binomial)

Refinement: Staring at mean and going up and down.
Algorithm 2 NB Recursion (Up and Down from the Mean)
1: for $n \in[1, N]$ do
2: $\quad \operatorname{nbpdf}(1, n(1-p) / p) \leftarrow 1$
3: $\quad$ for $k \in[m(n)-\alpha \sqrt{N}, m(n)]$ do
4: $\quad \operatorname{nbpdf}(1, k-1) \leftarrow \operatorname{nbpdf}(1, k) /(n+k-1)(k) /(1-p)$
5: $\quad$ for $k \in[m(n), m(n)+\alpha \sqrt{N}-1]$ do
6: $\quad n b p d f(1, k+1) \leftarrow n b p d f(1, k)(n+k) /(k+1)(1-p)$
7: $\quad$ Normalize $n b p d f$ to obtain $\mathbb{P}(N B(n, 1-p)=k)$
8: $\quad S(n) \leftarrow \sum_{k} \mathbb{P}(N B(n, 1-p)=k) \max ((n+k) \rho-n / p, 0)$
9: $\quad E[W] \leftarrow E[W]+S(n) / n$
10: Output $E[W]$

## Numerical Algorithm (Negative Binomial)

Table 1: Comparison of Two Approaches Generating Negative Binomial
Probabilities

| $k$ | $n_{1}=10$ | $n_{2}=10$ | $k$ | $n_{1}=100$ | $n_{2}=100$ | $k$ | $n_{1}=1000$ | $n_{2}=1000$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 40 | 0.0279638 | 0.0279638 | 400 | 0.0089128 | 0.0089128 | 4000 | 0 | 0.0028207 |
| 41 | 0.0272818 | 0.0272818 | 401 | 0.0088906 | 0.0088906 | 4001 | 0 | 0.0028200 |
| 42 | 0.0265023 | 0.0265023 | 402 | 0.0088641 | 0.0088641 | 4002 | 0 | 0.0028192 |
| 43 | 0.0256394 | 0.0256394 | 403 | 0.0088333 | 0.0088333 | 4003 | 0 | 0.0028182 |
| 44 | 0.0247071 | 0.0247071 | 404 | 0.0087983 | 0.0087983 | 4004 | 0 | 0.0028170 |
| 45 | 0.0237188 | 0.0237188 | 405 | 0.0087592 | 0.0087592 | 4005 | 0 | 0.0028158 |
| 46 | 0.0226875 | 0.0226875 | 406 | 0.0087160 | 0.0087160 | 4006 | 0 | 0.0028144 |
| 47 | 0.0216256 | 0.0216256 | 407 | 0.0086689 | 0.0086689 | 4007 | 0 | 0.0028128 |
| 48 | 0.0205443 | 0.0205443 | 408 | 0.0086179 | 0.0086179 | 4008 | 0 | 0.0028111 |
| 49 | 0.0194542 | 0.0194542 | 409 | 0.0085631 | 0.0085631 | 4009 | 0 | 0.0028093 |
| 50 | 0.0183647 | 0.0183647 | 410 | 0.0085047 | 0.0085047 | 4010 | 0 | 0.0028074 |

## Limit When $M_{s} \rightarrow \infty$

## Theorem

(the idle-time representation) In the $G I / G I / 1$ queue with cdf's $F$ and $G$ having parameter 4-tuple ( $1, c_{a}^{2}, \rho, c_{s}^{2}$ ),

$$
E[W] \equiv E[W(F, G)]=\psi\left(1, c_{a}^{2}, \rho, c_{s}^{2}\right)-\phi(I),
$$

where

$$
\psi\left(1, c_{a}^{2}, \rho, c_{s}^{2}\right) \equiv \frac{E\left[(U-V)^{2}\right]}{2 E[U-V]}=\frac{\rho^{2}\left(\left[c_{a}^{2} / \rho^{2}\right]+c_{s}^{2}\right)}{2(1-\rho)}+\frac{1-\rho}{2}
$$

and

$$
\phi(I) \equiv \phi(F, G)=\frac{E\left[I^{2}\right]}{2 E[I]}=E\left[I_{e}\right] .
$$

## Limit When $M_{s} \rightarrow \infty$

## Corollary

 (reduction to idle time) For the $\mathrm{GI} / \mathrm{GI} / 1$ model with extremal interarrival-time $c d f F_{0}$ and extremal service-time $c d f G_{u}$,$$
\begin{aligned}
E\left[W\left(F_{0}, G_{u^{*}}\right)\right] & \equiv \lim _{M_{s} \rightarrow \infty} E\left[W\left(F_{0} / G_{u} / 1\right)\right] \\
& =\frac{c_{a}^{2}+\rho^{2} c_{s}^{2}}{2(1-\rho)}+\frac{1-\rho}{2}-\phi\left(I ; 1, c_{a}^{2}, \rho, c_{s}^{2}\right),
\end{aligned}
$$

where $I$ is the idle time in an $F_{0} / G_{u^{*}} / 1$ queue or, equivalently, in a $F_{0} / D / 1$ queue for an appropriate $D$.

## Numerical Algorithm (Negative Binomial)

Table 2: Performance of Algorithm with Different Truncation Levels

|  | Algorithm 2 |  |  |  |  | Minh and Sorli Algorithm |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\rho \backslash N$ | $2 \mathrm{E}+03$ | $4 \mathrm{E}+03$ | $8 \mathrm{E}+03$ | $1.6 \mathrm{E}+04$ | $2 \mathrm{E}+04$ | $T=1 E+07$ | $95 \% \mathrm{Cl}$ |  |
| 0.1 | 0.422229 | 0.422229 | 0.422229 | 0.422229 | 0.422229 | 0.422 | $7.79 \mathrm{E}-05$ |  |
| 0.2 | 0.903885 | 0.903885 | 0.903885 | 0.903885 | 0.903885 | 0.904 | $1.30 \mathrm{E}-04$ |  |
| 0.3 | 1.499234 | 1.499234 | 1.499234 | 1.499234 | 1.499234 | 1.499 | $1.71 \mathrm{E}-04$ |  |
| 0.4 | 2.304105 | 2.304105 | 2.304105 | 2.304105 | 2.304105 | 2.304 | $1.90 \mathrm{E}-04$ |  |
| 0.5 | 3.470132 | 3.470132 | 3.470132 | 3.470132 | 3.470132 | 3.470 | $2.25 \mathrm{E}-04$ |  |
| 0.6 | 5.294825 | 5.294825 | 5.294825 | 5.294825 | 5.294825 | 5.294 | $2.43 \mathrm{E}-04$ |  |
| 0.7 | 8.441305 | 8.441305 | 8.441305 | 8.441305 | 8.441305 | 8.442 | $3.05 \mathrm{E}-04$ |  |
| 0.8 | 14.916937 | 14.916937 | 14.916937 | 14.916937 | 14.916937 | 14.917 | $3.22 \mathrm{E}-04$ |  |
| 0.9 | 34.721476 | 34.721484 | 34.721484 | 34.721484 | 34.721484 | 34.722 | $5.17 \mathrm{E}-04$ |  |
| 0.95 | 74.552341 | 74.619631 | 74.620917 | 74.620937 | 74.620937 | 74.621 | $7.11 \mathrm{E}-04$ |  |

## Performance in the Heavy-traffic

Table 3: Performance of Algorithm 2 in Heavy Traffic

| Case |  |  | Algorithm 2 |  | Minh and Sorli |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\rho \backslash N$ | $1 \times 10^{4}$ | $2 \times 10^{4}$ | $3 \times 10^{4}$ | $4 \times 10^{4}$ | $T=1 \times 10^{7}$ |  |
| 0.98 | 194.0544167173 | 194.5385548017 | 194.5559125683 | 194.5567071265 | 194.556 | $9.29 \mathrm{E}-04$ |
|  | $5 \times 10^{4}$ | $1 \times 10^{5}$ | $2 \times 10^{5}$ | $3 \times 10^{5}$ |  |  |
| 0.98 | 194.5567179973 | 194.5567742874 | 194.5567742874 | 194.5567742874 | 194.556 | $9.29 \mathrm{E}-04$ |
| $\rho \backslash N$ | $1 \times 10^{4}$ | $3 \times 10^{4}$ | $5 \times 10^{4}$ | $1 \times 10^{5}$ | $T=1 \times 10^{7}$ |  |
| 0.99 | 372.0880005430 | 372.0880005430 | 391.8858614678 | 394.5238008176 | 394.532 | $1.45 \mathrm{E}-03$ |
|  | $2 \times 10^{5}$ | $3 \times 10^{5}$ | $4 \times 10^{5}$ | $5 \times 10^{5}$ |  |  |
| 0.99 | 394.5331823499 | 394.5331886695 | 394.533188669 | 394.5331886695 | 394.532 | $1.45 \mathrm{E}-03$ |

## Upper Bound Approximation

## Theorem

In the setting of previous theorems,

$$
\begin{equation*}
W(D(1 / p), R S(D(\rho), p)) \leq_{i c x} W(D(1 / p), M(\rho / p)) \tag{2}
\end{equation*}
$$

so that well known results for the $D / M / 1$ queue yield

$$
\begin{equation*}
E\left[W\left(F_{0}, G_{u^{*}}\right)\right] \leq \frac{[2(1-\rho) \rho /(1-\delta)] c_{a}^{2}+\rho^{2} c_{s}^{2}}{2(1-\rho)} \tag{3}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $\delta \in(0,1)$ solves the equation

$$
\begin{equation*}
\delta=\exp (-(1-\delta)) / \rho) \tag{4}
\end{equation*}
$$

## Upper Bound Inequalities

Overall Upper Bound Inequalities:

## Upper Bound Inequalities

Overall Upper Bound Inequalities:

$$
E[W(F, G)] \leq E\left[W\left(F_{0}, G_{u^{*}}\right)\right](\text { Tight UB })
$$

## Upper Bound Inequalities

Overall Upper Bound Inequalities:

$$
\begin{aligned}
E[W(F, G)] & \leq E\left[W\left(F_{0}, G_{u^{*}}\right)\right](\text { Tight UB }) \\
& \leq \frac{2(1-\rho) \rho /(1-\delta) c_{a}^{2}+\rho^{2} c_{s}^{2}}{2(1-\rho)}(\text { UB Approx })
\end{aligned}
$$

## Upper Bound Inequalities

Overall Upper Bound Inequalities:

$$
\begin{aligned}
E[W(F, G)] & \leq E\left[W\left(F_{0}, G_{u^{*}}\right)\right](\text { Tight UB }) \\
& \leq \frac{2(1-\rho) \rho /(1-\delta) c_{a}^{2}+\rho^{2} c_{s}^{2}}{2(1-\rho)}(\text { UB Approx }) \\
& <\frac{\rho^{2}\left(\left[(2-\rho) c_{a}^{2} / \rho\right]+c_{s}^{2}\right)}{2(1-\rho)}(\text { Daley }(1977))
\end{aligned}
$$

## Upper Bound Inequalities

Overall Upper Bound Inequalities:

$$
\begin{aligned}
E[W(F, G)] & \leq E\left[W\left(F_{0}, G_{u^{*}}\right)\right](\text { Tight UB }) \\
& \leq \frac{2(1-\rho) \rho /(1-\delta) c_{a}^{2}+\rho^{2} c_{s}^{2}}{2(1-\rho)}(\text { UB Approx }) \\
& <\frac{\rho^{2}\left(\left[(2-\rho) c_{a}^{2} / \rho\right]+c_{s}^{2}\right)}{2(1-\rho)}(\text { Daley }(1977)) \\
& <\frac{\rho^{2}\left(\left[c_{a}^{2} / \rho^{2}\right]+c_{s}^{2}\right)}{2(1-\rho)}(\operatorname{Kingman}(1962))
\end{aligned}
$$

## Upper Bound Inequalities

Overall Upper Bound Inequalities:

$$
\begin{aligned}
E[W(F, G)] & \leq E\left[W\left(F_{0}, G_{u^{*}}\right)\right](\text { Tight UB }) \\
& \leq \frac{2(1-\rho) \rho /(1-\delta) c_{a}^{2}+\rho^{2} c_{s}^{2}}{2(1-\rho)}(\text { UB Approx }) \\
& <\frac{\rho^{2}\left(\left[(2-\rho) c_{a}^{2} / \rho\right]+c_{s}^{2}\right)}{2(1-\rho)}(\text { Daley }(1977)) \\
& <\frac{\rho^{2}\left(\left[c_{a}^{2} / \rho^{2}\right]+c_{s}^{2}\right)}{2(1-\rho)}(\operatorname{Kingman}(1962))
\end{aligned}
$$

where $\delta \in(0,1)$ and $\delta=\exp (-(1-\delta) / \rho)$.

## Summary for Upper Bound

Table 4: A comparison of the bounds and approximations for the steady-state mean $E[W]$ as a function of $\rho$ for the case $c_{a}^{2}=c_{s}^{2}=4.0$ and $c_{s}^{2}=4.0$.

| $\rho$ | Tight LB | HTA | Tight UB | UB Approx | $\delta$ | MRE | Daley | Kingman |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 0.10 | 0.00 | 0.044 | 0.422 | 0.422 | 0.000 | $0.003 \%$ | 0.44 | 2.24 |
| 0.20 | 0.00 | 0.200 | 0.904 | 0.906 | 0.007 | $0.19 \%$ | 1.00 | 2.60 |
| 0.30 | 0.00 | 0.514 | 1.499 | 1.51 | 0.041 | $0.60 \%$ | 1.71 | 3.11 |
| 0.40 | 0.00 | 1.07 | 2.304 | 2.33 | 0.107 | $0.94 \%$ | 2.67 | 3.87 |
| 0.50 | 0.25 | 2.00 | 3.470 | 3.51 | 0.203 | $1.15 \%$ | 4.00 | 5.00 |
| 0.60 | 1.00 | 3.60 | 5.295 | 5.35 | 0.324 | $1.07 \%$ | 6.00 | 6.80 |
| 0.70 | 2.42 | 6.53 | 8.441 | 8.52 | 0.467 | $0.93 \%$ | 9.33 | 9.93 |
| 0.80 | 5.50 | 12.80 | 14.92 | 15.02 | 0.629 | $0.67 \%$ | 16.00 | 16.40 |
| 0.90 | 15.25 | 32.40 | 34.72 | 34.84 | 0.807 | $0.35 \%$ | 36.00 | 36.20 |
| 0.95 | 35.13 | 72.20 | 74.62 | 74.76 | 0.902 | $0.18 \%$ | 76.00 | 76.10 |
| 0.98 | 95.05 | 192.1 | 194.6 | 194.7 | 0.960 | $0.07 \%$ | 196.0 | 196.0 |
| 0.99 | 195.0 | 392.0 | 394.5 | 394.7 | 0.980 | $0.04 \%$ | 396.0 | 396.0 |

## Thank You!

