Worksheet 2

QUESTIONS FOR CRITICAL REVIEW OF A RESEARCH REPORT

Directions: Select a research article to critique from the list provided. Identify the article. Write a response to each question/statement. Critique may be either an individual effort or group project. If group project, make sure to list all names. All participants will receive the same points. Students are encouraged to do the assignment as a group project as you will learn from each other discussing the article. In addition, be prepared to discuss the article and your critique in class.

Purpose of the Research and Hypotheses (if stated) (10 points)

Explain the extent to which the purpose(s) of the investigation is clearly stated and supported adequately.

How did the author(s) identify the specific questions to be answered and/or the hypotheses to be tested?

What were the theoretical and scientific underpinnings? Was a conceptual framework apparent?

Literature Review (10 points)

How did the authors relate this study to other studies that have been done?

How current is the literature reviewed?

Is the literature cited relevant to investigation?

To what extent do studies reviewed and cited build the case for this study?

Design (10 points)

What research design was used? Was it appropriate?

Variables (10 points)

What were the sources of data and what data collection methods were used?

Identify the independent, dependent and control (confounding) variables.

How satisfactory was the discussion of the reliability, validity and other characteristics of the measuring instruments?

Sample (10 points)

Was the target population identified?

How was the sample selected? Does the sample represent the target population?

What was the rationale given for the sample size?

What was the response rate?

Describe the sample. If applicable, was there evidence that the study groups were
comparable? Was there attrition? Were the characteristics of those who dropped out of the study (including reasons for dropping out) described?

Analysis and Results (10 points)
Were the research questions answered and/or were the hypotheses tested adequately?
What statistical tests were used? Were they appropriate?
What did the data say in relation to the study questions and/or hypotheses?
Were the results presented adequately?

Discussion and Conclusions (10 points)
Were the author's conclusions consistent with the results?
Are there alternative explanations for the findings and if so, were they discussed?

Implications (10 points)
To what extent did the author discuss the implications/relevance for practice and/or future research?

Alternative Designs (10 points)
With which other research designs might the research question(s) have been answered?
What are the advantages and disadvantages of each design?

Strengths and weaknesses (10 points)
Overall, what might this research add to clinical practice?
What are the strengths and weaknesses?
What limitations were identified by the authors?
Was their discussion of the limitations adequate?