

Political Science W3951 section 001
Comparative Politics Seminar
Democratic & Authoritarian Regimes, and the Cases of India and Pakistan
TUESDAYS 9-11; 711 IAB
Philip Oldenburg (pkol@columbia.edu)
Office hours: by appointment

This course will survey briefly the literature on why certain countries are democratic and others are not, and then consider (also briefly) the important cases of India and Pakistan. Students will choose two countries – with luck, at least one of which you have studied in some detail in some other course -- and write a substantial research paper comparing their regime-choice history, seeking explanations for differing (or similar) paths.

Requirements

- class attendance and participation in discussion on the basis of completed reading;
- paper-preparation assignments (see below);
- substantial research paper (6,000-8,000 words)

Readings: Available either from an e-journal, or posted on CourseWorks. It is probably worth buying a copy of Robert Dahl, *Polyarchy* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1971).

Date	Topic & readings
Sept 4	Introduction: why do some countries have an democratic regime, and others an authoritarian one? What methods have been used to answer that question? Why are India (mainly a democracy since 1947) and Pakistan (mainly an autocracy since 1947) such useful cases to compare? I: Theoretical tools
Sept 11	Democratic and Authoritarian Regimes Dahl 1971: 1-47; Haber 2005; Hadenius 1992: 9-35; Schmitter & Karl 1991; <i>State of Democracy in South Asia Report</i> , pp. 2-32
Sept 18	Processes: Breakdowns & Transitions Linz 1978; O'Donnell & Schmitter 1986: 3-14, 48-72; Przeworski 1986; Riggs 1993; Schmitter 1995
Sept 25	Correlations: Regimes & society, development, culture Boix & Stokes 2003; Donno & Russett 2004; Epstein et al. 2006; Hadenius & Teorell 2005; Przeworski 2005; Weingast 1997 II: Why has India been (mainly) a Democracy and Pakistan (mainly) an Autocracy?
Oct 2	Some published answers; An overview of the political histories of India and Pakistan Answers: Adeney & Wyatt 2004; Ahsan 2005 & Desai 2005; Hasan 2001; Jaffrelot 2002; Jalal 1995: 1-8, 247-257; Manor 1990; Subrahmanyam 2006 Histories: Ahmad 2001; Kennedy 2005; Oldenburg 1999; Oldenburg 2002; Rizvi 2003, Yadav 1999

Oct 9 Political movements and choices, to 1971

Sarkar 2001; Kumar 1989; McGrath 1998: 102-133; Oldenburg 1985; Sayeed 1968; Sayeed 1982; Talbot 2000: 162-166, 196-200; Waseem 1989: 87-137; Waseem 2005 [2002]

Oct 16 Socio-cultural arguments: Islam, Hinduism, and inequality

Alam 2002; Mehta 2004; van der Veer 1994: 1-24; Nasr 2005; Shah 1994; Shaikh 1986; *recommended*: Dahl 1971: 105-188

Oct 23 Political economy arguments: class domination and inequality

Alavi 1983; Attwood 1992: 291-319; Brass 1990: 269-278; Krishna 2006; Dewey 1991; Monshipouri & Samuel 1995; Sims 1988: 164-180; Zaidi 2005c: 7-18, 24-28, 47-54; *recommended*: Dahl 1971: 48-104;

Oct 30 Political choices, post 1971, and in particular, the March 1977 elections in India and Pakistan

Austin 2002; Baxter 1977;; DeSouza 2002; Embree 1983; Heller 2000; Mayer 1984; Syed 1978; Weinbaum 1977; Weiner 1978; Weiner 1983; Zaidi 2005a; *recommended*: Dahl 1971: 189-227

Nov 6 No class

III: Class presentations

Nov 13 Why ["my"] two countries? [Assignment: 250 word summary, to be posted on CourseWorks one day in advance of class, with hard copies handed out in class]

Nov 20 Research sources, methods [Assignment: preliminary bibliography, to be handed in at class]

Nov 27 First round of presentations of work-in-progress

Dec 4 Second round of presentations of work –in-progress

Dec 11 Papers due

BIBLIOGRAPHY (INCLUDING WORKS NOT ASSIGNED, BUT POSSIBLY USEFUL FOR A PAPER)

Adeney, Katharine; and Andrew Wyatt.. 2001. "Explaining South Asia's Uneven Democratic Career." In: Jeff Haynes, ed., *Towards Sustainable Democracy in the Third World*. Houndsmills, Basingstok, Hampshire: Palgrave.

Ahmad, Samina. 2001. "The Fragile Base of Democracy in Pakistan" In: Amita Shastri and A. Jayaratnam Wilson, eds., *The Post-colonial States of South Asia* (Richmond, Surrey: Curzon), pp. 41-68.

Ahsan, Aitzaz. 2005. "Why Pakistan is Not a Democracy." In: Meghnad Desai and Aitziz Ahsan.. *Divided by Democracy* (Delhi: Roli Books): 75-144.

Alavi, Hamza. 1983. "Class and State." In: Hassan Gardezi & Jamil Rashid, eds. *Pakistan: The Roots of Dictatorship; the Political Economy of a Praetorian State* (Delhi: Oxford University Press.): 40-93.

Attwood, Donald W. 1992. *Raising Cane: The Political Economy of Sugar in Western India*. Boulder: Westview.

- Austin, Granville. 2002. "The Expected and the Unintended in Working a Democratic Constitution." In: Zoya Hasan, E. Sridharan, and R. Sudarshan, eds., *India's Living Constitution: Ideas, Practices, Controversies* (Delhi: Permanent Black): 319-343.
- Barro, R. J. 1999. "Determinants of Democracy." *Journal of Political Economy* 107, 6 Part 2 (December): 158-183.
- Baxter, Craig. 1977. "Constitution Making: the Development of Federalism in Pakistan." *Asian Survey* 14, 12 (December): 1074-1085. [EJOURNAL]
- Boix, Carles; and Susan Carol Stokes. 2003. "Endogenous Democratization." *World Politics* 55, 4 (July): 517-49 [EJOURNAL]
- Brass, Paul R. 1990. *The Politics of India Since Independence*. First edition. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Bunce, Valerie. 2003. "Rethinking Recent Democratization: Lessons from the Postcommunist Experience." *World Politics* 55, 2 (January): 167-92. [Online]
- Burki, Shahid Javed. 1980. *Pakistan under Bhutto, 1971-1977*. London: McMillan.
- Collier, David; and Steven Levitsky. 1997. "Democracy with Adjectives: Conceptual Innovation in Comparative Research." *World Politics* 49, 3 (April): 430-451. [Online]
- Corbridge, Stuart; and John Harriss. 2000. *Reinventing India: Liberalization, Hindu Nationalism, and Popular Democracy*. Delhi: Oxford University Press.
- Dahl, Robert A. 1971. *Polyarchy*. New Haven: Yale University Press. [MULTIPLE COPIES IN COLUMBIA'S LIBRARIES]
- Dewey, Clive. 1991. "The Rural Roots of Pakistani Militarism." In: D.A. Low, ed., *The Political Inheritance of Pakistan* (New York: St Martin's Press): 255-283.
- Donno, Daniela; and Bruce Russett. 2006. "Islam, Authoritarianism, and Female Empowerment: What are the Linkages?" *World Politics* 56 (July): 582-607 [EJOURNAL]
- Embree, Ainslie. 1983. "The Emergency as a Signpost to India's Future." In: Peter Lyon and James Manor, eds., *Transfer and Transformation: Political Institutions in the New Commonwealth* (Leicester: Leicester University Press): 59-67.
- Embree, Ainslie. 1990. *Utopias in Conflict*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Epstein, David; Robert Bates, Jack Goldstone, Ida Kristensen, Sharyn O'Halloran. 2006. "Democratic Transitions." *American Journal of Political Science* 50, 3 (July): 551-569. [EJOURNAL]
- Foweraker, Joe; and Todd Landman. 2004. "Economic Development and Democracy Revisited: Why Dependency Theory Is Not Yet Dead." *Democratization* 11, 1 (February): 1-20
- Frankel, Francine. 2005. *India's Political Economy, 1947-2004*. Second Edition. Delhi: Oxford University Press.
- Gallagher, Mary E. 2002. "Reform and Openness"; Why China's Economic Reforms Have Delayed Democracy." *World Politics* 54, 3 (April): 338-72. [Online]
- Gerring, John; Philip Bond, William T. Barndt, Carola Moreno. 2005. "Democracy and Economic Growth: A Historical Perspective." *World Politics* 57 (April): 323-364. [Online]
- Gibson, Edward L. 2005. "Boundary Control; Subnational Authoritarianism in Democratic Countries." *World Politics* 58 (October): 101-32 [Online]

- Haber, Stephen. 2005. "Authoritarian Government." In: Barry Weingast and Donald Witman, eds., *The Oxford Handbook of Political Economy* (Download: <http://www.stanford.edu/~haber/papers/Haber-Logic-of-Authoritarian-Government.pdf>)
- Hadenius, Axel. 1992. *Democracy and Development*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Hadenius, Axel, ed. 1997. *Democracy's Victory and Crisis*. Nobel Symposium No. 93. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Hadenius, Axel; and Jan Teorell. 2005. "Cultural and Economic Prerequisites of Democracy: Reassessing Recent Evidence." *Studies in Comparative International Development* 39, 4 (Winter): 87-106.
- Hasan, Mushirul. 2001. "India and Pakistan: Why the Difference?" In: Mushirul Hasan and Nariaki Nakazato, eds., *The Unfinished Agenda* (New Delhi: Manohar): 309-343.
- Heller, Patrick. 2000. "Degrees of Democracy; Some Comparative Lessons from India." *World Politics* 52, 4 (July): 484-519. . [EJOURNAL]
- Higley, J.; and M. Burton. 1989. "The Elite Variable in Democratic Transitions and Breakdowns." *American Sociological Review* 54: 17-32.
- Huber, Evelyne; Dietrich Rueschemeyer; John D. Stephens. 1997. "The Paradoxes of Contemporary Democracy: Formal, Participatory, and Social Democracy." *Comparative Politics*, 29, 3 (April): 323-342.
- Ibrahim, Anwar. 2006. "Universal Values and Muslim Democracy." *Journal of Democracy* 17, 3 (July): 5-12.
- International Crisis Group. 2002a. *Pakistan: Madrasas, Extremism and the Military*. Asia Report No. 36.
- International Crisis Group. 2002b. *Pakistan: Transition to Democracy?* Asian Report No. 40 (October)]
- International Crisis Group. 2003. *Pakistan: The Mullahs and the Military*. Asia Report No. 49.
- International Crisis Group. 2005. *Authoritarianism and Political Party Reform in Pakistan*. Asia Report N°102 (28 September)
- International Crisis Group. 2007. *Elections, Democracy, and Stability in Pakistan*. Asia Report N°137 – 31 July 2007
- Jacobshohn, Gary J. 2003. *The Wheel of Law: India's Secularism in Comparative Constitutional Context*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Jaffrelot, Christophe. 2000. "Hindu Nationalism and Democracy." In: Francine R. Frankel, Zoya Hasan, Rajeev Bhargava, Balveer Arora, eds., *Transforming India; Social and Political Dynamics of Democracy* (Delhi: Oxford University Press): 352-378.
- Jaffrelot, Christophe. 2002. "India and Pakistan: Interpreting the Divergence of Two Political Trajectories." *Cambridge Review of International Affairs* 15, 2 (July): 251-267. [EJOURNAL]
- Jalal, Ayesha. 1995. *Democracy and Authoritarianism in South Asia*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Kennedy, Charles H. 2005. "Constitutional and Political Change in Pakistan: The Military-Governance Paradigm." In: Rafiq Dossani and Henry S. Rowen, eds., *Prospects for Peace in South Asia* (Stanford: Stanford University Press): 37-74.
- Kitschelt, Herbert. 2003. *State Failure, Globalization, and Regime Conflict: Origins of Contemporary International Terrorism in the Middle East*. [Electronic edition: http://library.fes.de/fulltext/id/01712.htm#P17_4068] Bonn: Friederich Ebert Stiftung.

- Kohli, Atul, ed. 2001. *The Success of India's Democracy*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Krishna, Anirudh. 2006. "Poverty and Democratic Participation Reconsidered: Evidence from the Local Level in India." *Comparative Politics* 38, 4 (July): 439-458.
- Kumar, Ravinder. 1989. "The historical roots of democracy in India." In: Ravinder Kumar, *The Making of a Nation: Essays in Indian History and Politics*. Delhi: Manohar. Pp. 229-244. From *Harvard International Review* May 1985.
- Linz, Juan J. 1978. *Breakdown of Democratic Regimes: Crisis, Breakdown, and Reequilibration*. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press. [122pp.] [MULTIPLE COPIES IN COLUMBIA'S LIBRARIES, AS A SEPARATE PUBLICATION AND AS PART ONE OF Juan Linz and Alfred Stepan, editors, *The Breakdown of Democratic Regimes* (Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1978)]
- Mainwaring, Scott. 1999. "The Surprising Resilience of Elected Governments" *Journal of Democracy* – 10, 3: 101-114
- Manor, James. 1990. "How and Why Liberal and Representative Politics Emerged in India." *Political Studies* 38, 1 (March): 20-38. [EJOURNAL]
- Mayer, Peter. 1984. "Congress (I), Emergency (I); Interpreting Indira Gandhi's India." *Journal of Commonwealth and Comparative Politics* 22, 2 (July): 128-150.
- McGrath, Allen. 1998. *The Destruction of Pakistan's Democracy*. Karachi: Oxford University Press.
- Mehta, Pratap Bhanu. 2004. "Hinduism and Self-Rule" *Journal of Democracy* 15, 3 (July): 108-122 [EJOURNAL]
- Nasr, Vali. 2005. "The Rise of "Muslim Democracy." *Journal of Democracy* 16, 2: 13-27 [EJOURNAL]
- Noman, Omar. 1997. *Economic and Social Progress in Asia: Why Pakistan Did Not Become a Tiger*. Karachi: Oxford University Press.
- O'Donnell, Guillermo; Philippe C. Schmitter, Laurence Whitehead, eds. 1986. *Transitions from Authoritarian Rule: Comparative Perspectives*. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press.
- O'Donnell, Guillermo; and Philippe C. Schmitter. 1986. *Transitions from authoritarian rule: Tentative conclusions about uncertain democracies*. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press. [75pp.] [MULTIPLE COPIES AVAILABLE IN COLUMBIA'S LIBRARIES; this is the stand-alone version of the concluding part of O'Donnell et al. 1986]
- Oldenburg, Philip. 1985. "A Place Insufficiently Imagined?: Language, Belief, and the Pakistan Crisis of 1971." *Journal of Asian Studies* 44, 4 (August): 711-733 [EJOURNAL]
- Oldenburg, Philip 1999. "Politics." In: *Students' Encyclopedia Britannica India*. New Delhi: Encyclopedia Britannica. [COURSEWORKS DOCUMENT]
- Oldenburg, Philip, 2002. "A Political History of Pakistan." E-Seminar for Columbia Interactive. Author's notes. [COURSEWORKS DOCUMENT]
- Przeworski, Adam. 1986. "Some Problems in the Study of Transition to Democracy." In: Guillermo O'Donnell et al., *Transitions from Authoritarian Rule: Comparative Perspectives*. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press. Pp. 47-63.
- Przeworski, Adam. 2005. "Self-enforcing Democracy." In: Donald Wittman and Barry Weingast, eds., *Oxford Handbook of Political Economy* (New York: Oxford University Press). (Download: <http://www.nyu.edu/gsas/dept/politics/faculty/przeworski/papers/wittman.pdf>)

- Ram, N. 2000. "The Great Indian Media Bazaar: Emerging Trends and Issues for the Future." In: Romila Thapar, ed., *India: Another Millennium?* (New Delhi: Viking):241-292
- Riggs, Fred W. 1963. "Bureaucrats and Political Development: A Paradoxical View." In: Joseph LaPalombara, ed., *Bureaucracy and Political Development* (Princeton: Princeton University Press): 120-167.
- Riggs, Fred W. 1993. "Fragility of the Third World's Regimes." *International Social Science Journal* 45, 2 (May):199-243.
- Rizvi, Gowher. 1985. "Riding the Tiger: Institutionalising the Military Regimes in Pakistan and Bangladesh." In: Christopher Clapham and George Philip, eds., *The Political Dilemmas of Military Regimes* (London: Croom Helm): 201-236.
- Rizvi, Hasan Askari. 2003. *Military, State and Society in Pakistan*. London: Macmillan and Lahore: Sang-e-Meel Publications.
- Robinson, Francis. 1992. "Origins." In: William E. James, Subroto Roy, eds., *Foundations of Pakistan's Political Economy: Towards and Agenda for the 1990s* (New Delhi: Sage): 33-57.
- Robinson, Marguerite. 1988. *Local Politics: The Law of the Fishes*. Delhi: Oxford University Press.
- Rudolph, Lloyd I.; Susanne Hoeber Rudolph. 1978. "To the Brink and Back: Representation and the State in India." *Asian Survey*, 18, 4. (April): 379-400.
- Sayeed, Khalid bin. 1967. *The Political System of Pakistan*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin..
- Sayeed, Khalid bin. 1968. *Pakistan, the formative phase, 1857-1948*; 2nd ed. London, New York [etc.] Oxford University Press.
- Sayeed, Khalid bin. 1982. "The historical origins of some of Pakistan's persistent political problems." In A. Jayaratnam Wilson and Dennis Dalton, eds., *The States of South Asia; Problems of National Integration* (London: Hurst; Delhi: Vikas): 27-44.
- Schmitter, Philippe C. 1995. "Transitology: The Science or Art of Democratization?" In: Joseph S. Tulchin, with Bernice Romero, ed., *The Consolidation of Democracy in Latin America*. Boulder: Lynne Rienner: Pp. 11-41.
- Schmitter, Philippe C.; and Terry Lynn Karl. 1991. "What Democracy Is . . . and Is Not." *Journal of Democracy* 2, 3 (Summer): 75-88. [EJOURNAL]
- Shah, Ghyansham. 1994. "Identity, Communal Consciousness, and Politics." *Economic and Political Weekly* 29, 19 (May 7): 1133-1140.
- Shaikh, Farzana. 1986. "Islam and the Quest for Democracy in Pakistan." *The Journal of Commonwealth & comparative politics* 24, 1: 74 – 92.
- Sims, Holly. 1988. *Political Regimes, Public Policy, and Economic Development: Agricultural Performance and Rural Change in Two Punjab*s. New Delhi: Sage.
- State of Democracy in South Asia Report*. 2006. SDSA team, Lokniti (CSDS): Delhi.. Forthcoming from Delhi: Oxford University Press. [COURSEWORKS DOCUMENT]
- Subrahmanyam, Gita. 2006. "Ruling Continuities: Colonial Rule, Social Forces and Path Dependence in British India and Africa." *Commonwealth and Comparative Politics* 44, 1 (March): 84-117. [EJOURNAL]
- Syed, Anwar H. 1978. "Pakistan in 1977: the 'Prince' is Under the Law." *Asian Survey* 18, 2 (February): 117-125. [EJOURNAL]
- Talbot, Ian. 2000. *India and Pakistan; Inventing the Nation*. London: Arnold.
- Waseem, Mohammad. 1989. *Politics and the State in Pakistan*. Lahore: Progressive.

- Waseem, Mohammad. 2005. "Causes of Democratic Downslide in Pakistan." In: Veena Kukreja and M. P. Singh, eds., *Pakistan: Democracy, Development, and Security Issues* (New Delhi: Sage): 39-58. Also in *Economic and Political Weekly* 38, 44-45 (9-15 November 2002).
- Weinbaum, M. G. 1977. "The March 1977 Elections in Pakistan: Where Everyone Lost." *Asian Survey* 17, 7 (July): 599-618. [EJOURNAL]
- Weiner, Myron. 1978. *India at the Polls: The Parliamentary Elections of 1977*. Washington: American Enterprise Institute. Ch. 5: "New Delhi: the returns come in." Pp. 57-63.
- Weiner, Myron. 1983. "The Wounded Tiger: Maintaining India's Democratic Institutions." In: Peter Lyon and James Manor, eds., *Transfer and Transformation: Political Institutions in the New Commonwealth* (Leicester: Leicester University Press): 49-57.
- Weingast, Barry R. 1997. "The Political Foundations of Democracy and the Rule of Law." *American Political Science Review* 91, 2 (June): 245-263 [EJOURNAL]
- Yadav, Yogendra. 1999b. "Politics." In: Marshall Bouton and Philip Oldenburg eds., *India Briefing: A Transformative Fifty Years* (Armonk, New York: M. E. Sharpe): 3-38.
- Yadav, Yogendra. 2000. "Understanding the Second Upsurge." In: Frankel, Francine R.; Zoya Hasan, Raveev Bhargava, Balveer Arora, eds, *Transforming India: Social and Political Dynamics of Democracy* (Delhi: Oxford University Press): 120-143.
- Zaidi, S. Akbar. 2005a. "State, Military and Social Transition: Improbable Future of Democracy in Pakistan." *Economic and Political Weekly* 40, 49 (December 3).
- Zaidi, S. Akbar. 2005b. *The Political Economy of Decentralisation in Pakistan*. Transversal Theme "Decentralisation and Social Movements" Working Paper No. 1. [Switzerland]: National Centre of Competence in Research. [ONLINE at: www.nccrnorth-south.unibe.ch (then: Publications)]